

HUMBERSIDE FIRE AUTHORITY

11 DECEMBER 2015

PRESENT:

Representing East Riding of Yorkshire Council:

Councillors Chapman MBE, Green, Hodgson, Jefferson JP and Matthews

Representing Kingston upon Hull City Council:

Councillors Allen, Mathieson and Payne

Representing North Lincolnshire Council:

Councillors Briggs (Chairperson), Grant, Sherwood and Waltham

Representing North East Lincolnshire Council:

Councillors Burton, Jackson, Shepherd and Sutton

Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive, Deputy Chief Fire Officer/Executive Director Service Delivery, Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer, Monitoring Officer/Secretary, Director of Service Support, Head of Human Resources and Committee Manager were also present.

Mr M Allingham, Mr D Chapman, Mr J Doyle, Mrs M Thomlinson and Mr C Vertigans (Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee) also attended as observers.

Apologies for absence were submitted from Councillors Clarkson, Finlay, Fudge, Sharpe, Turner and Wilson.

The meeting was held at the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service Headquarters, Kingston upon Hull. Meeting commenced at 10.30 a.m.

(The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Chapman MBE who was attending her first meeting after a period of illness; expressed best wishes to Councillor Clarkson following her recent operation, and also reported that Mr Prentice, KPMG was recovering from his recent illness and was planning to return to work. The Chairperson welcomed the Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee and all other persons who were present.)

4982 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST - There were no declarations.

4983 MINUTES – Resolved – That the minutes of the meeting of the Authority held on 23 October 2015 having been printed and circulated amongst the Members, be taken as read and correctly recorded and be signed by the Chairperson.

4984 QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no questions had been received from Members in accordance with Rule 12, Part 4 of the Constitution.

4985 PETITIONS AND DEPUTATIONS - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no petitions had been received and no requests for a deputation had been received under Rule 13, Part 4 of the Constitution.

4986 COMMUNICATIONS - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no communications had been received.

4987 MEMBERS' NEWSLETTER – This item was included on the Agenda to allow Members an opportunity to ask questions regarding any items included in the Members' Newsletter that had been emailed recently to all Members of the Authority. There were no questions.

MINUTES OF COMMITTEES

4988 Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee – The minutes of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee held on 2 November 2015 were submitted. It was noted that the reference to "Hull City Hall" in Minute 4971 (Scrutiny Programme 2015/16 – Business Safety – Update) on page 8 of the minutes and also in the report for Agenda Item No.9 should state "Hull Guildhall". **Resolved** – That the minutes of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee held on 2 November 2015 be received, and the amendment to Minute 4971 noted.

4989 GOVERNANCE, AUDIT AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE SCRUTINY PROGRAMME 2015/16 – BUSINESS SAFETY REVIEW OUTCOMES – The Monitoring Officer/Secretary submitted a report indicating that the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee on 2 November 2015 had considered a report by the Chairperson of that Committee detailing the outcomes from the scrutiny undertaken by the Committee in respect of Business Safety. The report indicated that following scoping discussions it was subsequently agreed that two aspects of Business Safety should be scrutinised in more detail:

- Technical fire safety
- Unwanted fire signals

The scrutiny outcomes were detailed in Appendix 1 to the report. The GAS Committee (Minute 4971 refers) agreed to recommend to the Authority that:

- (i) the Authority takes assurance that the Business Safety team, supported by colleagues in the Directorate of Emergency Response, is proactive in seeking to continually improve the technical fire safety provision, work in the most effective ways and add value through partnership working;
- (ii) the Authority support the running of additional Business Safety seminars as a cost effective way of reaching a number of businesses;
- (iii) the Authority consider asking the Corporate Management Team to present, at a Member Day, on the range of approaches taken nationwide to address unwanted fire signals;
- (iv) that a small piece of work be carried out by the Business Safety team to review unwanted fire signals activity at the level of business type e.g. agricultural, small retail etc. to:
 - Establish if there are any patterns
 - Evaluate whether there may be merit in sector specific education initiatives.
- (v) the Authority consider requesting that the Corporate Management Team specify aspirational positioning against other fire and rescue services in some of the outcome measures in the next strategic plan.

At the invitation of the Authority the Chairperson of the GAS Committee presented the scrutiny outcomes and the Committee's recommendations to the Fire Authority and in doing so expressed thanks to the Director of Public Support and other Officers for all the assistance they provided during the scrutiny process. The Chairperson referred to recommendation (v) regarding benchmarking and stated that he had noted that the National Audit Office report on the Agenda for this meeting also mentioned the use of benchmarking. Members welcomed the report which showed the detail work which the GAS Committee was

able to undertake. A Member sought clarification of the Service's stance when undertaking fire safety inspections of small businesses. The Director of Public Safety explained that the Service operates a risk based inspection programme and also visit premises in response to false alarms or a fire incident and engage with the owners of the business regarding fire safety issues. A Member queried how the Service engages with business and stated that that in North Lincolnshire there was a network of some 100 businesses which could possibly be used. The Director of Public Safety stated that the Service had contact details for all businesses in the area. The Chairperson of the Fire Authority expressed thanks to the GAS Committee for their report and their work generally which is very helpful and supportive to the Authority and stated that the GAS Committee Members would be welcome to attend future Member Days to allow them the opportunity to meet with Members of the Authority. The Monitoring Officer/Secretary referred to Minute 4981 (Scrutiny Work Programme 2015/16) which invited the Authority to put forward any suggested topics for scrutiny and suggested that if Members have any topics they should contact the Chairperson of the GAS Committee or himself as soon as possible prior to the next meeting of the GAS Committee.

Resolved – (a) That the Authority takes assurance that the Business Safety team, supported by colleagues in the Directorate of Emergency Response, is proactive in seeking to continually improve the technical fire safety provision, work in the most effective ways and add value through partnership working;

(b) that the Authority support the running of additional Business Safety seminars as a cost effective way of reaching a number of businesses;

(c) that the Corporate Management Team be requested to present, at a Member Day, on the range of approaches taken nationwide to address unwanted fire signals;

(d) that a small piece of work be carried out by the Business Safety team to review unwanted fire signals activity at the level of business type e.g. agricultural, small retail etc. to:

- Establish if there are any patterns
- Evaluate whether there may be merit in sector specific education initiatives.

(e) that the Corporate Management Team be requested to specify aspirational positioning against other fire and rescue services in some of the outcome measures in the next strategic plan;

(f) that if Members have any topics for future scrutiny by the GAS Committee they should contact the Chairperson of the GAS Committee or the Monitoring Officer/Secretary as soon as possible prior to the next meeting of the GAS Committee, and

(g) that the Members of the GAS Committee be invited to future Member Days.

4990 NATIONAL AUDIT OFFICE REPORTS - FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY OF FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICES AND IMPACT OF FUNDING REDUCTIONS ON FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICES - The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer submitted a report drawing attention to the following two reports published by the National Audit Office (NAO) on 5 November 2015:

- Financial sustainability of fire and rescue services
- Impact of funding reductions on fire and rescue services

Copies of the NAO reports were attached to the report. The NAO reports focused on both the financial sustainability of fire and rescue services and on the impact of funding

reductions since 2010. The detailed findings and recommendations were contained within the reports but a broad conclusion was that whilst fire and rescue services had coped well with funding cuts, there were emerging signs of potential financial stress at some authorities. Humberside Fire and Rescue Service was not in this position as a result of previous early decisions on efficiency measures. It was essential that that approach was continued into the medium-term given the recent Comprehensive Spending Review (CSR) announcements. The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer stated that he anticipated that in due course the Department for Communities and Local Government would issue a response to the NAO reports.

A Member stated that there was a hint in the reports that benchmarking of Fire Services would help. The Chairperson stated that the previous Peer Challenge reviews were very robust when the Peer Team visited the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service. The Chief Fire Officer/Chief Executive informed Members that the Chief Fire Officers' Association had recently decided that benchmarking measures for Peer Reviews should be clearer and more transparent.

Resolved - That Members note the contents of the two National Audit Office reports.

4991 TREASURY MANAGEMENT MID-YEAR UPDATE REPORT 2015/16 – The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer submitted a report providing an update on the Authority's treasury management activities for the first half of the financial year 2015/16. The report showed complete compliance with the Authority's Capital Expenditure and Treasury Management Prudential Indicators and also investment returns in line with the benchmark rate of return provided by Capita Asset Services. Interest earned during the first six months of 2015/16 exceeded the budget by £23k. The Authority on 16 March 2015 had approved the annual Treasury Management Policy Statement and agreed a range of Prudential Indicators as set out in Appendix 1 to the report, aimed at ensuring effective treasury management and affordability of capital plans. The report ensured compliance with recommended practice as outlined in the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIFPA) Code of Practice on Treasury Management 2009 by providing Members with an update on treasury management undertaken since the beginning of the financial year and highlighting key Prudential Indicator information. During the period April to September 2015, the Authority had operated wholly within the limits approved. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 4975 refers).

Resolved - That Members note the treasury management activities undertaken during the first half of 2015/16 and the Prudential Indicators as outlined in paragraphs 16 and 17 and detailed in Appendix 1 to the report now submitted.

4992 FINANCIAL PLANNING 2016/17 ONWARDS - The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer submitted a report, further to Minute 4962, considering the Authority's Revenue Budget for the period 2016/17 onwards. The current financial position of the Authority was sound but there would be significant challenges to that position in the medium-term. In summary, the financial projections for the next four financial years after 2015/16 were as follows:

2016/17	Balanced;
2017/18	£1.3m deficit;
2018/19	£2.2m deficit;
2019/20	£3.0m deficit.

The requirement to make further efficiencies would continue into the medium-term. The report also set out the arrangements for the precept/council tax consultation for 2016/17. Appendix 1 of the report set out the latest position on the Authority's Revenue Budget for 2016/17 onwards. The key assumptions that have been incorporated into the budget are

included in the Table 1 graph 8 of the report. Appendix 1 set out a balanced budget for 2016/17, a £1.3m deficit for 2017/18, a £2.2m deficit for 2018/19 and a £3.0m deficit for 2019/20. Appendix 2 of the report showed the information that was being used as part of the Precept/Council Tax Consultation for 2016/17. The consultation would be web-based with articles in the local press and on social media to highlight the process. The options put forward for consideration are 0% or an increase of 1.9%. The consultation would run for approximately six weeks from 1 December 2015 to 8 January 2016 and the responses would be incorporated into the February 2016 budget report to Members.

The Chancellor of the Exchequer had announced the details of the Comprehensive Spending Review (CSR) 2015 on 25 November 2015. The CSR set out the Government's spending plans for the years 2016/17 to 2019/20. Unprotected Government Departments, such as Department for Communities and Local Government, would again encounter significant austerity over the medium-term. The projections showed a halving of central Government grant to local authorities over 2016/17 to 2019/20 with mitigating assumptions made by the Treasury on increases in the council tax base and business rates over the same period. The distributional effects of that reduction in central support to local government would be felt hardest by the authorities that were proportionately most reliant on central funding. At the time of writing the report a date for the more detailed local government finance settlement for 2016/17 which would identify funding at the Authority level had not yet been announced and therefore an email briefing would be circulated to Members before the Christmas break. The report identified relevant key dates up to budget setting in February 2016.

A Member referred to Appendix 1 to the report and stated that he would find it helpful if he could have some explanation of the financial detail. The Chairperson suggested that this could be provided at a Member Day. A Member referred to the Precept/Council Tax leaflet at Appendix 2 to the report and the statement in the report that it would be a web based consultation exercise and queried whether there would be a postal option for anyone not having access to a computer. The Chairperson stated that the consultation leaflet would be amended to include a reference to the availability of postal copies.

Resolved – (a) That Members note the report and the financial challenges for the period 2016/17 onwards and that the precept/council tax report be considered at the February 2016 Authority meeting, and

(b) that the Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer include a briefing session on Appendix 1 to the report at the next Member Day.

4993 CAPITAL PROGRAMME 2016/17 ONWARDS – VEHICLES, ESTATES AND IT –

The Director of Service Support submitted a report setting out for approval the proposed capital programme for vehicles, estates and ICT for 2016/17 onwards. The programme had been approved by the Corporate Management Team (CMT). With regard to the vehicle replacement programme the report indicated that in the last 12 months the Service had taken delivery of one Aerial Ladder Platform, one Incident Command Unit and Three Tactical Response Vehicles which represented £1.3m of investment. The new specialist vehicle that assists with the support of victims of fire and flooding was now operating in partnership with the Red Cross. A review had been carried out of the vehicle replacement programme for 2016/17 – 2020/21 and was set out in Appendix 1 to the report. The review had identified that the replacement cycle for fire appliances required updating. Therefore, the next order was scheduled for 2018/19. That amendment had identified potential capital savings of £2.8m within the next five years. Further savings could be achieved depending on the outcome of any future Operational Efficiency Programme (OEP). As a result of the Incident Command review relating to both Strategic and Middle Managers, further reductions could be made in the light vehicle FDS fleet, with potential savings of £270k within the next five years due to the reduction of FDS officers. Due to the establishment of the new venture with the Police regarding the vehicle workshops (ESFM) there was no longer a requirement for

the Service to replace vehicles for mobile workshops. That change would achieve savings of £100k within the next five years. In light of the above the predicted capital expenditure relating to vehicles was limited to £76k for 2016/17. The rolling programme of vehicle replacement as summarised below was set out in Appendix 1 to the report:

Vehicle Replacement Programme For 2015/16 To 2020/21

	<u>2016/17</u>	<u>2017/18</u>	<u>2018/19</u>	<u>2019/20</u>	<u>2020/21</u>
Heavy Vehicles	-	770,000	1,400,000	1,750,000	-
Light vehicles	76,000	391,000	293,000	129,000	306,000
Total all vehicles	76,000	1,161,000	1,693,000	1,879,000	306,000

The base estates Capital Programme for 2016/17 and 2017/18 were as follows:

<u>2016/17</u>	
Block Allocation	£500k
Invest to Save	£200k
SHQ Works	£200k
Total	£900k

<u>2017/18</u>	
Block Allocation	£500k
Invest to Save	£200k
Total	£700k

The ICT Capital Programme for 2016/17 and 2017/18 were as follows:

<u>2016/17</u>	
Replacement Programme (including Microsoft Enterprise Agreement)	£200k
Upgrade of Fireground Radios & Emergency Services Network Devices	£200k
Agile/Flexible Working Services	£50k
Station End Equipment Resilience Upgrade and PA Systems	£55k
Information Systems Upgrades and Development	£70k
Total	£575k

<u>2017/18</u>	
Replacement Programme (including Microsoft Enterprise Agreement)	£200k
Upgrade of Fireground Radios & Emergency Services Network Devices	£200k
Agile/Flexible Working Services	£50k
Station End Equipment Resilience Upgrade and PA Systems	£55k
Information Systems Upgrades and Development	£70k
Total	£575k

Subject to approval of the recommendations contained within the report, the financial effect of the proposals would be incorporated into the Authority's revenue and capital plans for 2016/17 onwards that will be presented for consideration and final approval at the Fire

Authority in February 2016. The most appropriate method of financing the assets set out in the report would be determined on the basis of value for money and risk to the Authority. That assessment would be undertaken prior to the start of the financial year in liaison with the Authority’s Treasury Management advisors.

Resolved - That Members approve the capital programme for vehicles, estates and ICT for 2016/17 onwards and that it is incorporated into the Medium-Term Financial Plan 2016/17 to 2019/20 to be considered at the 15 February 2016 Fire Authority meeting.

4994 SERVICE PERFORMANCE AND RISK REPORT - 2ND QUARTER PERIOD JULY–SEPTEMBER 2015 - The Corporate Planning & Performance Manager submitted a report providing information relating to the Service’s Performance and Risk Framework which was highlighted in the following summary table and Appendix 1 to the report:

Section 1 – Strategic Risks	
Reduction in external financial support	No change in risk.
Emergency Services Mobile Communications Programme (ESMCP)	No change in risk.
East Coast and Hertfordshire Control Room Project	No change in risk
Review and Development of Protective Security	No change in risk
Section 2 – Prevention Performance	
Accidental Dwelling Fires	21.5% under 3 year average.
Other Accidental Fires (exc. Vehicles)	10.9% over 3 year average.
Deliberate Primary Fires	7.3% over 3 year average.
Deliberate Secondary Fires	0.2% over 3 year average.
Number of Automatic Fire Alarms	10.7% under 3 year average.
Fatalities	1 fatality (aspirational target 0)
Injuries	13 injuries (aspirational target 0)
Section 3 – Response Performance	
First engine response	7.61% better than target
Second engine response	12.49% better than target
Section 4 – Projects Update	
Key projects are reported in this section	All on track except ARK
Section 5 – Absence Statistics	
Key data is reported in this section	There has been a minor increase for Wholetime, Retained, and Control. There has been a drop in non-operational sickness.

Further detailed information was contained within Appendix 1 to the report and also the supporting information published alongside the Agenda papers for this meeting on the Authority’s website. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 4977 refers).

Resolved – That Members take assurance as to the Service’s proactive approach to performance and risk management.

4995 HEALTH, SAFETY AND ENVIRONMENTAL REPORT - 2ND QUARTER PERIOD JULY–SEPTEMBER 2015 - The Director of Service Support submitted a report providing information with regard to Health, Safety and Environmental outcomes for the 2nd Quarter Period July – September 2015. During this period there had been 23 incidents recorded that resulted in some sort of injury which was a significant decrease on the same period last year

(36 incidents) and the last quarter (38 incidents). Again training would appear to be the main contributing activity with 10 incidents being reported, however, 7 of those events related directly to water rescue training which also accounted for an increase in injury/accident type relating specifically to 'hitting something fixed or stationary'. On-going liaison with the Training Section to mitigate such events wherever possible continued. The 2nd quarter is when the majority of the Services water rescue training is undertaken. During this period 3 RIDDOR events were reported, an increase of 2 on the last quarter and 1 more than the same period last year. As a result of the events reported, including one of the RIDDOR events cited, an underlying issue with the stowage of breathing apparatus has since been resolved. The 3rd event listed in the report is currently under investigation. A significant rise in the number of vehicle collisions was attributed to staff being actively encouraged to report all incidents involving vehicles. With this in mind a number of the events cited could be seen to be minor in nature. The Service was also pleased to confirm that Philip Smith had received an invitation to speak at the next Inside Government conference in London on 'Delivering an Award Winning Health and Safety Management Approach to the Fire and Rescue Service', building on the achievement last quarter in attaining the Industry Sector Silver Award from the Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents. A snap-shot of the quarter was attached in Appendix 1 to the report and the full detailed report was attached in Appendix 2. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 4978 refers).

Resolved – That Members note the report and take assurance as to the Service's proactive approach to Health, Safety and Environmental outcomes.

(Councillor Hodgson left the meeting 11.23am at the start of the following item.)

4996 OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OPTIONS FOR FORMAL CONSULTATION - The Deputy Chief Fire Officer/Executive Director Service Delivery submitted a report reminding Members that the implementation of a number of operational efficiency options was approved by Members on 31 January 2014. Those options had now been fully implemented. In approving the implementation of those options Members had considered the predicted impact, in particular on performance against the Authority's Response Standards. As Members were aware Service performance was not adversely affected by implementation. In fact, largely due to continued effective preventative work and the Authority's investment in the mobilising infrastructure, performance had actually improved to a position whereby the Service is performing at a higher level against the Response Standards than it was prior to implementation. The financial projections for the Authority, detailed elsewhere on the Agenda for this meeting (Minute 4992 above refers), meant that further reductions in spend on operational response would be required. Members had been presented with information relating to a number of options to reduce the expenditure on operational response at the Member Day on 27 November 2015. That information had a particular focus on the following:

- First engine response standard performance
- Second engine response standard performance
- Risk predictions
- Finances

The report set out the types of options which could be considered. The full range of possible options and the detailed predictions for their impact were included at Appendix 1 to the report. All of the potential options that could be implemented, whilst ensuring that the Service still meets the Authority's Response Standards had been presented to Members at a Member Day when Officers also explained their professional view as to which options it would not be advisable to implement. Members were reminded that at the meeting on 31 January 2014 there was one option which Officers recommended for implementation that was not approved by the Authority. That option, to remove one full time fire engine from the Immingham area, had been modelled again using the most up to date data. There were a number of other options which were engaged upon in 2012, but were not taken forward for

formal consultation, partly due to the relatively low levels of savings which could be realised. Those options had also been modelled again using up to date data, and that same data had been used to model any other potential options as well.

In terms of financial drivers the Service faced a budget deficit of around £2.1 million by 2018/19 and it was expected that another £1.1 million would need to be saved by 2019/20. As Members were aware the Service Redesign Programme (SRP) was projected to identify potential savings of £1 million. Therefore that meant that it was expected that £2.2 million would still need to be saved by 2019/20. Other savings in addition to the SRP work were being considered, particularly from discretionary spends and it was anticipated that if the operational efficiency options recommended were approved there would also be other related savings in equipment and training which would further contribute to the overall savings required. It was also possible that the SRP savings could be in excess of £1million. It was therefore felt that until the full extent of the SRP savings, and the extent of other savings which might arise, were known, it was not currently necessary to consider options to deliver the anticipated, post SRP deficit of £2.2 million. However, it was felt that savings circa £1million should be approved for implementation during 2016/17 to ensure that the deficit can be managed until the start of 2019/20. If options to deliver savings of that magnitude are approved then it was felt that no further operational savings would be required to be implemented until 2019/20 at the earliest.

In terms of other drivers the report indicated that Members should be aware that due to the retirement profile of the Service and the gradual, and prudent, implementation of previously approved options that crewing levels had reduced as predicted. That meant there would, if no options were approved which reduce the wholetime firefighter establishment, be a need to recruit for 2016/17. Whilst recruitment would naturally be welcomed it was likely that Members would need to consider a reduction of full time firefighters sometime in the next few years in any case, given that the maximum savings available if only on call (Retained Duty) engines were considered would be circa £700k. If that was the case then it was felt that to recruit now would not be prudent, because it would simply increase the financial burden on the Authority and could also increase the likelihood that the Authority might have to consider firefighter redundancies at some point in the future. The Authority had previously stated its intention to avoid firefighter redundancies if at all possible and none had been needed so far. If there was a decision taken to reduce the full time operational establishment in 2016/17 then Officers predicted that there would be no need to consider firefighter redundancies at any time during the period covered by the Government's latest Spending Review. As Members were also aware the Service had diversified the services it provided. The Service was currently providing medical services in partnership with Yorkshire Ambulance Service and East Midlands Ambulance Service and was trialling a falls response with the Hull Clinical Commissioning Group. There might be opportunities to be commissioned to deliver some similar, or related, services in the future and that meant that if any decisions are taken to reduce the full time firefighter establishment early then there would be a number of supernumerary staff that could be utilised if those opportunities arose. Should those opportunities be realised then it was anticipated that recruitment could be undertaken over the next few years in any case.

A Consultation Plan was included at Appendix 2 to the report. The purpose of the consultation with staff and external stakeholders was to enable Elected Members to consider the views of the consultation participants when coming to a decision as to which options, if any, should be implemented. If the Authority approved consultation on options then it was proposed that the results of the consultation, and any subsequent recommendations, would be brought before the Authority meeting in March 2016 for consideration. The Authority had a proven track record of making decisions early, which had enabled Officers to effectively plan and manage budgets effectively over a number of years. If there is a decision to implement any of the options recommended for consultation then Officers would implement that decision when required, in line with the Service retirement profile and resources needed across Service Delivery. Whilst any one option could be implemented within each

geographical area, as shown at Appendix 1, Officers had a professional view regarding which should be considered for formal implementation at this time as set out in the report. Taking all of the considerations into account it was the Officer view that the following options for consultation be considered in order of preference i.e. it was the Officer view that the first option, to only consult upon options in Immingham, was the preferred option for consultation:

Option 1 - Consult upon the two options in Immingham

- Merge Immingham East and West Fire Stations and remove one fire engine.
- or
- Remove one fire engine from Immingham West.

Option 2 - Consult upon only those options which are predicted to have zero affect on first engine Response Standards

- Merge Immingham East and West Fire Stations and remove one fire engine.
- Remove one fire engine from Market Weighton or Brough.
- Remove one fire engine from Hornsea.
- Remove one fire engine from Withernsea.

Option 3 - Members decide on a different range of options for consultation by either setting a different 'bar' to determine which are considered (similar to the zero effect on Response Standard 'bar' above, for example consulting on any options that have an impact on first engine Response Standards of less than 0.1%) or deciding to consult upon the full range of possible options.

Resolved - (a) That Members approve formal consultation on the following operational efficiency options:

- Merge Immingham East and West Fire Stations and remove one fire engine or Remove one fire engine from Immingham West.
- Remove one fire engine from Market Weighton or Brough.
- Remove one fire engine from Hornsea.
- Remove one fire engine from Withernsea.

(b) that Members endorse the Consultation Plan set out in the report,

(c) that Members receive the consultation results at the March 2016 Authority meeting, and

(d) that Members decide what options, if any, to implement at a meeting to be held in June 2016.

4997 EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS/PUBLIC - Resolved – That the press and public be excluded from the meeting for consideration of the following item (Minutes 4998-5000) on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraphs 3 and 4 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

(In making its decision the Authority confirmed that having regard to all the circumstances it was satisfied that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information).

4998 EAST HULL INTEGRATED CARE CENTRE – The Director of Service Support and Director of Emergency Response submitted a report seeking approval to relocate the existing East Hull station on Southcoates Lane, to the proposed East Hull Integrated Care Centre (ICC) on the site of the former David Lister School. Re-location within the ICC will facilitate greater integration between the Fire Service and health, social care and the voluntary sector and allow the Service to further enhance its ability to protect those most vulnerable within its communities while ensuring the very best use of the Service's resources. The proposal presented had been approved by the Corporate Management Team.

Resolved - That Members approve the proposal to re-locate the existing East Hull station to a new fit-for-purpose facility within the proposed East Hull ICC and that an update on the lease negotiations be submitted to the next meeting of the Authority.

4999 SERVICE REDESIGN PROGRAMME (SRP) TRANSACTIONAL ADMINISTRATION AND DATA MANAGEMENT REVIEW - The Director of Service Support submitted a report indicating that as Members were aware the Service Redesign Programme (SRP) will review all aspects of service delivery, excluding front-line fire station based emergency response, which had been subject to a separate review via an Operational Efficiency Programme (OEP) during 2013/14. The goal of the SRP therefore was to identify opportunities to make Service support and delivery more efficient, responsive and flexible in order to help meet the challenges the Service faced. Whilst no direct financial targets had been applied, it was expected that the net deliverable SRP outcomes would make a significant contribution to mitigate the risk of further reductions in external financial support. However that should not preclude investment in service improvement where that will result in increased flexibility, efficiency and added value in the medium to long term. Reports updating Members on the budget position 2015/16 onwards were considered at the September, October and December 2014 and February, March, June and September 2015 Fire Authority meetings. A review of transactional administrative elements of clerical support and data across the following areas of Service support had identified significant opportunities for change and rationalisation as set out in the report. The review had identified that alternative delivery approaches could offer significant efficiencies in scale, improve customer focus and responsiveness, increase resilience and provide greater adaptability to change. Achieving economies in scale, implementing new ways of working and maximising the benefits of enabling technology could deliver financial savings of circa £450k, during 2016/17. The following documents were appended to the report:

- A conceptual structural model outlining core areas of responsibility (Appendix 1);
- A comparison of the proposed delivery concept compared to the current delivery model including advantages, disadvantages and risks (Appendix 2), and
- A Business Case supporting the proposal (Appendix 3).

A Staff engagement process had been carried out from 3-17 November 2015 and part of that process included two concepts, firstly a Public Safety Contact Centre and secondly a Data and Risk Hub. Having listened to the feedback given by staff during the engagement stage, including 102 responses to an on-line survey, it had been decided that those two concepts would instead be considered in greater depth during on-going SRP and Directorate reviews of Public Safety Preparedness and Delivery (incorporating direct clerical and administrative support for Business and Community Safety teams), Emergency Response Preparedness and Service Support. Reviews of Service Headquarters based support functions would also incorporate the delivery and resourcing of more specialist administrative activities. Further detail would be presented to Members during the first quarter of 2016.

Resolved - That Members approve the commencement of a six week consultation period from early January 2016, for the proposal set out in the report and attached appendices and that an update be submitted to the meeting of the Authority in March 2016.

5000 EARLY VOLUNTARY RELEASE - The Head of Human Resources presented a report by the Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer indicating that in the context of continuing budget reductions, it was appropriate for the Authority to have in place arrangements to facilitate the voluntary release of employees from the organisation. The report provided details of a proposed Early Voluntary Release policy for Humberside Fire & Rescue Service staff. The policy would provide Local Government Pension Scheme (LGPS) members of staff with an opportunity to apply for early release following the initiation of organisation restructuring which could result in a change to the ways of working and/or a reduction in the number of posts.

Resolved - That Members approve the Early Voluntary Release (EVR) policy attached to the report and that applications be invited from LGPS members of staff over the coming weeks through to late January 2016 and that an update be submitted to the meeting of the Authority in March 2016.

5001 COLLABORATION UPDATE - The Chief Fire Officer/Chief Executive reported orally that as discussed at the Member Day on the 27 November 2015, and following on from the discussions at the Fire Authority meeting on the 23 October 2015, Officers had been in contact with Officers from neighbouring Fire and Rescue Services to discuss the potential for collaboration. As part of those discussions it became apparent that North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service were doing a similar exercise and in fact were already forming a view that in their opinion the most beneficial Service to further talks with was Humberside Fire and Rescue Service. A report to the North Yorkshire Fire Authority on 9 December 2015 had been circulated separately for Members' information. That Authority had agreed to approach the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service "with a view to developing a full business case for merger between North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Authority and Humberside Fire Authority". The Chief Fire Officer/Chief Executive outlined his view of a hierarchy of drivers for change.

Resolved – (a) That Members support the discussions with North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service and that an update be submitted to the meeting of the Authority in February 2016, and

(b) that in conjunction with North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service a letter be sent to the Fire Minister informing him that both Fire Authorities are discussing an outline business case for greater collaboration up to and including a full merger.

Meeting closed at 12.26pm