

## HUMBERSIDE FIRE AUTHORITY

24 OCTOBER 2014

### PRESENT:

#### Representing East Riding of Yorkshire Council:

Councillors Chapman MBE, Green, Mole, Moore, Pearson and Turner

#### Representing Kingston upon Hull City Council:

Councillors Clarkson, Mathieson, Petrini and Wilson

#### Representing North Lincolnshire Council:

Councillors Briggs, Marper, Swift and Waltham

#### Representing North East Lincolnshire Council:

Councillors Baxter and Walker

Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive, Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer, Monitoring Officer/ Secretary and Committee Manager were also present.

Mr D Chapman, Mr J Doyle, Mr A Smith, Mrs A Thomlinson and Mr C Vertigans (Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee) also attended as observers.

Apologies for absence were submitted from Councillors Burton, Head, Hodgson, Norton, Quinn and Thompson.

The meeting was held at the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service Headquarters, Kingston upon Hull. Meeting commenced at 10.30 a.m.

*(The Chairperson welcomed the Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee and all other persons who were present.)*

**4658 MARK OF RESPECT** – The Chairperson referred to the recent sad loss of the Vice Chairperson of the Authority, Councillor Doreen Engall MBE, Councillor Angela Ibson and also three firefighters who had died recently. All present stood in silence as a mark of respect.

**4659 NEW MEMBERS** – The Chairperson welcomed new and returning Members (Councillors Clarkson, Mole and Pearson).

**4660 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST** - There were no declarations.

**4661 MINUTES** – *Resolved* – That the minutes of the meeting of the Authority held on 26 September 2014 having been printed and circulated amongst the Members, be taken as read and correctly recorded and be signed by the Chairperson.

**4662 QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS** - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no questions had been received from Members in accordance with Rule 12, Part 4 of the Constitution.

**4663 PETITIONS AND DEPUTATIONS** - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no petitions had been received and no requests for a deputation had been received under Rule 13, Part 4 of the Constitution.

**4664 COMMUNICATIONS** – The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no communications had been received.

**4665 MEMBERS' NEWSLETTER** – This item was included on the Agenda to allow Members an opportunity to ask questions regarding any items included in the Members' Newsletter that had been emailed recently to all Members of the Authority. There were no questions.

**4666 ELECTION OF VICE CHAIRPERSON 2014/15** - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary submitted a report on the election of a Vice Chairperson for 2014/15 in place of Councillor Engall MBE (deceased). Councillor Chapman MBE was nominated and seconded. The Secretary of the Labour Group stated that given the circumstances in which the vacancy had arisen the Labour Group would not be nominating a Member for the position on this occasion.

**Resolved** - That Councillor Chapman MBE be elected Vice Chairperson of the Humberside Fire Authority until the Annual General Meeting of the Authority in 2015.

**4667 COMPOSITION OF THE FIRE AUTHORITY 2014/15 – NEW MEMBERS** - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary submitted a report indicating that since the meeting of the Authority on 26 September 2014 the Authority had been notified of the following appointments:

East Riding of Yorkshire Council

Councillor Claude Mole	(Conservative)	In place of Councillors Ibson
Councillor Bryan Pearson	(Conservative)	(deceased) and Engall MBE
		(deceased)

Hull City Council

Councillor Carol Clarkson	(Labour)	In place of Councillor
		Sumpton

**Resolved** – That the revised membership of the Authority for the period 2014/15 as set out in Appendix 1 to the report be noted.

**4668 APPOINTMENT OF GROUP SECRETARY – CONSERVATIVE GROUP - Resolved** - That it be noted that the Conservative Group has appointed Councillor Green as Group Secretary in place of Councillor Ibson (deceased).

**4669 APPOINTMENT OF INDEPENDENT CO-OPTED MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNANCE, AUDIT AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE** - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary submitted a report further to Minute 4633 and reported that the Interview Panel (Councillors Briggs, Petrini and Mr D Chapman) had met immediately prior to this meeting to conduct a further interview and give further consideration to a candidate interviewed on 1 August 2014 for possible appointment as an Independent Co-opted Member of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny (GAS) Committee. The Monitoring Officer/Secretary reported that the Interview Panel had recommended that the Fire Authority appoint Mrs P Jackson.

**Resolved** – That the Authority endorse the recommendation of the Interview Panel and approve the appointment of Mrs Pamela Jackson as an Independent Co-opted Member of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee for an initial 3 year period to 30 September 2017 subject to satisfactory references being obtained.

**MINUTES OF COMMITTEES**

**4670 Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee – Resolved** – That the minutes of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee held on 13 October 2014 be received.

**4671 INDUSTRIAL ACTION UPDATE** - Further to Minute 4632 the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive informed Members of the latest views expressed by the Fire Minister and

the Fire Brigades' Union regarding the dispute and stated that he would keep Members informed of any further developments.

**Resolved** – That the report be noted.

**4672 Transformation Fund** - Further to Minutes 4510 and 4544 the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive reported orally that he had only recently received notification that the Authority's three bids for funding from the Transformation Fund had all been unsuccessful and that Officers would now investigate possible alternative sources of funding for the Ark Project (Flood response)/East Hull CCG collaboration.

**Resolved** - That the report be received.

**4673 AWARDS FOR HFR SOLUTIONS AND THE EXTRICATION AND TRAUMA TEAMS** – The Deputy Chief Fire Officer/Executive Director Service Delivery submitted a report detailing the achievements of both HFR Solutions at the recent Hull & Humber and Bridlington & Yorkshire Coast Chamber of Commerce awards evening held at the Bridlington Spa on the 10 October 2014 and also the Service Trauma and Extrication teams who qualified to represent the United Kingdom and compete in the World Championships at the Fire Service College, Moreton-in-Marsh in October 2014. HFR Solutions was awarded the trophy for the Chamber of Commerce Social Enterprise of the Year for 2014. The Trauma team were crowned World Trauma Champions for 2014. The Extrication team earned the honour of being crowned the fourth best Road Traffic Collision rescue team in the world after all scores were collated. Humberside Fire and Rescue Service also provided both the Deputy Lead Assessor and one of the Internal assessors for the challenge and whilst clearly they were unable to score the activities of the Humberside teams they were actively engaged over the entire period of the competition and once again represented the Service to the highest standard. As World Champions for Trauma and with Fourth place for Extrication both teams will now be invited to once again represent the United Kingdom and defend their positions at the 2015 World Challenge which is to be hosted in Portugal.

**Resolved** – (a) That Members recognise the excellent achievements of HFR Solutions and the Extrication and Trauma Teams, and

(b) that arrangements be made for the successes to be formally acknowledged at the next Member Day.

#### **EXTERNAL AUDIT (KPMG)**

**4674 Annual Audit Letter 2013/14** – Further to Minute 4635 the Executive Director Service Support/Section151 Officer presented the final Annual Audit Letter in respect to the Authority's accounts for 2013/14 indicating that KPMG had issued an unqualified opinion on the Authority's 2013/14 financial statements; the Pension Fund 2013/14 financial statements included in the Authority's Statement of Accounts, and the Authority's Group which consists of the Authority itself and HFR Solutions and that KPMG had concluded that the Authority had made proper arrangements for securing financial resilience and challenging how to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness. Appendix 2 to the Annual Audit Letter summarised the outturn against the 2013/14 planned audit fee. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 4652 refers).

**Resolved** – That the Annual Audit Letter be noted.

**4675 MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTS 2014/15 – BASED ON PERIOD ENDING 30 SEPTEMBER 2014** - The Executive Director Service Support/Section151 Officer submitted a report containing the Authority's Management Accounts based on the period ending 30 September 2014. The end of year projections for the revenue budget, the capital programme, the pensions account and HFR Solutions were as follows:

<u>Category</u>	<u>2014/15 Outturn projection</u>
<u>Humberside Fire Authority</u>	
Revenue Budget	£544k underspend
Capital Programme	£8.164m expenditure against £12.056m allocation
Pensions Account	£8.445m deficit
<u>HFR Solutions</u>	
Surplus after Corporation Tax	£200k

**Resolved** – That Members take assurance from the report and the Authority’s financial position based on the period ending 30 September 2014.

**4676 BUDGET 2015/16 AND MEDIUM-TERM FINANCIAL PLAN 2015/16 ONWARDS -**

The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer submitted a report further to Minute 4637 providing a brief update with regard to the Authority’s budget for 2015/16 and Medium-Term Financial Plan for 2015/16 onwards. The report also outlined the work that will be undertaken on the budget for 2015/16, before the next report to the December 2014 Fire Authority meeting. Since the report to the Authority on 26 September 2014 further work had been undertaken on the budget for 2015/16 onwards and the current projections for the next three financial years were as follows:

<u>2015/16</u>	<u>2016/17</u>	<u>2017/18</u>
£112k	£2.071m	£3.534m
Deficit	Deficit	Deficit

Members were reminded that the report to the Authority in September 2014 signalled further financial austerity into the medium-term. Most uncertainty was attached to the years 2016/17 onwards as a result of the General Election to be held in May 2015. Funding allocations for 2016/17 onwards were not yet known and would be influenced by a number of factors when notified. The stance adopted by the Authority since the start of austerity (2011/12) had been to anticipate and make decisions early. That approach had served the Authority well so far. The report indicated that in the period leading up to the report to the Authority in December 2014 significant work would be undertaken by the Finance Team on the budget for 2015/16 onwards. The report identified key aspects of that work.

With regard to Council Tax for 2015/16 Members were reminded that the Authority had frozen its council tax precept in each of the years 2011/12 to 2014/15 inclusive. The last time the council tax precept was increased was therefore in the 2010/11 financial year. Members would be required to make a decision on the council tax precept for 2015/16 at the 16 February 2015 Fire Authority meeting. The choice was likely to rest between a 0% change and therefore participation in the Government’s freeze initiative (details of which were not yet known) or an increase close to any referendum threshold specified by Government (for 2014/15 that was set at 2%). The report indicated that a 1% increase in the council tax precept would raise approximately an additional £190k for the Authority. The report concluded that the Authority had responded well to the austerity that had been in place since 2011/12. The Authority’s financial position today was sound but further financial headwinds would challenge that in the near term and therefore the need to deliver further efficiencies before the 2016/17 financial year remained.

**Resolved** – (a) That Members note the report and that the detailed budget for 2015/16 onwards be brought to the December 2014 Fire Authority meeting, and

(b) that an item be included on the next Member Day updating Members on the emerging budget.

**4677 PROFESSIONAL PROPERTY SERVICES CONTRACT** - The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer submitted a report indicating that in order to deliver a comprehensive estates management service, the Authority employs additional external support under a Professional Property Services Contract to provide a wide-range of specialist services as set out in the report. The existing contract was awarded after an Official Journal of the European Union (OJEU) tender process to the East Riding of Yorkshire Council commencing October 2007 (Minute 1972 refers). The report informed Members of the plans to re-tender the contract for the Authority's Professional Property Services Contract and outlined the associated timetable for delivery. Discussions had taken place with Officers from East Riding of Yorkshire Council to ensure that there would be continuity over the coming months.

**Resolved** - (a) That Members note the progress towards securing a new Building Services Contractual arrangement;

(b) that the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive be given delegated authority to award a contract to the supplier demonstrating best value taking into consideration quality of service and price, and

(c) that a further report, outlining the outcome, be submitted to Members following the completion of the tendering process.

**4678 FIRE DEATH AND INJURY PANEL** - The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive submitted a report indicating that the Fire Death and Injury Panel (FDIP) which was currently Chaired by the Director of Operations (North) had been operating for over four years, involving latterly external stakeholders as well as internal staff. Humberside Fire and Rescue Service initiated the FDIP to enable a very detailed analysis of the chronological account following a serious fire where there was a fire related death or serious injury. Its aim was to develop local and strategic action plans drawn from lessons learned from serious incidents. The subsequent local action plan was forwarded to the Coroner and monitored for performance by Central Community Safety. Often the most significant learning points came from challenges from those who often do not deal with emergency response, and therefore the Service welcomed the views of other stakeholders. It was felt that due to the local interest and potential for Members to be questioned over a fire death or injury, the Fire Authority should consider nominating one or more representatives to attend the FDIP. One option could be a lead from each Unitary Authority area who will be informed when the FDIP is scheduled (normally within seven days of the incident). That Member would then decide to attend or request that another local elected Member attends on their behalf. At the FDIP the Member would be able to clarify and challenge any activities undertaken or any actions planned. In the past an Independent Member of the previous Governance and Standards Committee attended the FDIP and reflected how beneficial it was to be given detailed information into all activities before, during and following the most serious fires. It was now felt that given the changes in governance in the Authority if there was to be an attendance it would be more appropriate for it to be an elected Member of the Authority.

**Resolved** - That the Group Secretaries be authorised to nominate four Elected Members (1 representative from amongst the Members appointed by each Constituent Unitary Authority) to act as a lead representative at meetings of the Fire Death and Injury Panel on the basis set out in the report now submitted.

**4679 SERVICE REDESIGN PROGRAMME - INCIDENT COMMAND AND SPECIALIST FUNCTIONS REVIEW - OPTIONS FOR CONSULTATION** - The Chief Fire Officer & Executive submitted a report indicating that the Strategic Plan 2014-17, approved by the Authority on 14 March 2014, included an objective to conduct a service wide efficiency review, in addition to measures taken under the Operational Efficiency Programme (OEP). The review, now referred to as the Service Redesign Programme (SRP), commenced in April 2014 with a Senior Management Team review conducted by the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive. A SRP delivery team was subsequently formed in May 2014. Whilst the team had not been set financial savings targets it must be borne in mind that the Service

needed to reduce expenditure as detailed elsewhere on the Agenda for this meeting and that the review was part of the mitigation of the financial risks to the Authority. The first phase of activity had been to review delivery options for the provision of incident command and other related specialist functions, currently resourced predominantly through the Flexible Duty System (FDS), and to identify the optimum number of officers required for operational activities. Future phases of review activity would focus upon non-operational service delivery and wider service support provisions. The review had concluded that it was possible to reduce the overall number of Group, Station and Watch Managers whilst still maintaining, and in some areas increasing, the capacity for incident command related risk critical functions.

The first phase of review had focussed primarily on the optimum number of officers required for incident response activity, not necessarily functional management. Any reduction in officers would naturally reduce functional managerial capacity. However options at Group Manager level had already been mapped across the overarching functions of Service Delivery and Service Support and the Corporate Management Team (CMT) were confident that an efficient and effective functional management and incident command response structure at that level could be implemented with either option. An optimum managerial structure would be further developed during consultation. The potential financial costs or savings related to each option below Group Manager level were shown as a range which varied from the largest savings assuming that posts required for incident command were the only managerial posts required at that level to the smallest savings which assumed that there were changes to the number of incident commanders, but there was no overall change to the number of managerial posts. The final position on savings would be dependent on further areas to be reviewed as part of the SRP. The outcomes of this phase of the review were presented to CMT on 12 September 2014 and were discussed at the Member Day on 7 October 2014.

With regard to drivers for change the report indicated that whilst the team had not been set any specific targets relating to financial savings they were aware that the SRP was part of the mitigation put in place to deal with the financial risk highlighted in the Strategic Risk Register. Therefore there was an expectation that the SRP will provide options for the Authority to reduce the budget in future years in line with the predicted savings required described elsewhere on the Agenda for this meeting. Members were asked to bear in mind that in addition to the trial which reduces the number of Strategic Managers from thirteen in recent years to seven currently, decisions taken as part of the OEP had also reduced the establishment at fire station level and therefore it was felt appropriate that there were reductions in expenditure in activities not directly related to fire stations. CMT were also aware that as incident numbers had declined over a number of years that meant that officers attended fewer incidents as a result. Whilst that was excellent news for the Authority's communities and was a trend that the Authority would strive to continue, there might be an issue of officers not getting the exposure to incidents that was so beneficial to maintaining command competence. Clearly much of that risk was mitigated by existing training and command assessments, but it was still felt that it would be preferable in the future to have a smaller number of officers, each one attending a larger number of incidents. The changing nature of the risks in the Authority's area and the way the Service responds to them required the way the Service commands incidents to also be reviewed. The Service had changed significantly since the last review in 2010 in particular around the specialisms it delivered for flooding, technical rescue and other incidents. There was a need to consider strengthening the provision of certain specialisms as well as ensuring the Incident Command structure can meet the Authority's needs. However it was felt that whilst the numbers and distribution of different officer groups might change there was much that was in place within the current arrangements which worked well and should not be changed, such as:

- Incident command training and assessment
- Fire Investigation
- Use of "Flexi" Watch Managers for Specialisms

The report identified a number of imperatives that were applied throughout the review, ensuring that all risk critical considerations having an impact upon resourcing for incident command and specialist functions would be taken into consideration

Wide ranging engagement with operational managers at all levels had taken place since May 2014. A number of discussion areas were raised as set out in the report and had been taken into account when developing the options. In terms of review options a number of specific options had been developed relating to the operational managerial layers and numbers of officers required to deliver effective and efficient incident command and specialist functions, with a 24/7 provision. It was proposed that the options set out in the report should be subject to a 12 week period of internal and external consultation and an indicative Consultation Timetable was included at Appendix 1 to the report.

Details of the Roles and Role Maps for Group Manager, Senior Manager and Watch Manager posts were set out in Appendix 2 to the report. An indicative impact assessment of options was included at Appendix 3 to the report and a summary of options and financial efficiency ranges was included at Appendix 4 to the report. The report identified 9 options for consultation as set out below and outlined the benefits, risk and outcomes associated with each option:

Option Summary
1. <u>Group Manager FDS</u> - Reduction from 12 to 8 officers in line with retirement profiles, supporting 2 officers on immediate callout. Approximate financial efficiency of £296k.
2. <u>Group Manager FDS</u> - Reduction from 12 to 9 officers in line with retirement profiles, supporting 3 officers on immediate callout. Approximate financial efficiency of £183k.
3. <u>Station Manager FDS</u> - Reduction from 20 to 16 officers in line with retirement profiles, supporting 4 officers on immediate callout. Approximate financial efficiency within the range of £255k to £43k
4. <u>Station Manager FDS</u> - Reduction from 20 to 15 officers in line with retirement profiles, supporting 5 officers on immediate callout. Approximate financial efficiency within the range of £250k to £53k
5. <u>Station Manager - Day Duty</u> - Remove the role from the Service completely and gradually make the existing SMs into FDS SMs in line with the FDS retirement profile. Approximate financial efficiency within the range of £532k to £80k.
6. <u>Watch Manager Day Duty</u> - Reduction from 46 Day Duty to 20 Flexi Watch Managers and at least 10 Day Duty Watch Managers in line with retirement profiles, supporting 5 officers on immediate callout. Approximate financial efficiency within the range of a saving of £594k to a cost of £119k.
7. <u>Watch Manager Day Duty</u> - Reduction from 46 Day Duty to 18 Flexi Watch Managers and at least 12 Day Duty (Service Delivery) Watch Managers in line with retirement profiles, supporting 6 officers on immediate callout. Approximate financial efficiency within the range of a saving of £562k to a cost of £150k.
8. <u>Watch Manager Shift Duty System</u> - Reduction from 44 Shift Duty System to 16 Flexi Watch Managers in line with retirement profiles, supporting 4 officers on immediate callout. Their roles on watch would be replaced by 44 crew managers. Approximate financial cost of £645k.
9. <u>Command Unit Crewing Arrangements</u> - Change to the crewing and mobilising arrangements for the Command Unit currently sited at Calvert Lane Fire Station so it is crewed and mobilised predominantly by officers that work in the Incident Command School. Crewing costs are included within the WM arrangements at Option 7 or 8.

With regard to implementation the report indicated that all options could be achieved in line with the retirement profile of existing post holders, it was recognised that the transformation might take several years before full implementation could be achieved and all supernumerary posts were absorbed. Early adoption of options for GM posts was anticipated to be feasible however, pending the outcomes of consultation. An indicative Impact Assessment, based upon options within the report, was included at Appendix 3 to the report. Consideration had also been given to the impact of options on effective functional management activity. The options supported a more streamlined and focussed management and delivery structure.

Assuming options were approved for implementation in line with the indicative timetable at Appendix 1 to the report the following sequence would be used for the remainder of the SRP. It was important to establish the actual changes at each level sequentially as the report now submitted focussed on the requirements of Incident Command only and not the levels required for the management of the service, which would form part of the other areas in the SRP, albeit proposals for subsequent service support changes were being developed already.

- Senior Management Review (trial underway).
- Incident Command Review (for approval to consult).
- Interim Management Structure (To be established by CMT in order to implement any early changes).
- Community Safety Review (before HFA in 2015/16).
- Technical Fire Safety Review (before HFA in 2015/16).
- Control (Emergency Call Handling) Review (before HFA in 2015/16).
- Supporting Services Review (before HFA in 2015/16 or 2016/17).
- Final review of Management Structures (To be approved by HFA to provide the management structure required for the approved changes in Service Delivery and Service Support).

**Resolved** - (a) That Members approve the options for incident command and specialist functions detailed at Paragraphs 21 to 35 of the report now submitted, for internal and external consultation;

(b) that Members approve the consultation timetable detailed at Appendix 1 to the report, and

(c) that a standing item for future Member Days shall be to update Members on progress on the Service Redesign Programme.

**4680 EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC – Resolved** – That the press and public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following items (Minutes 4681 - 4682) on the grounds that they are likely to involve the disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraphs 1, 3 and 4 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

*(In making its decision the Authority confirmed that having regard to all the circumstances it was satisfied that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information).*

**4681 VEHICLE WORKSHOPS – UPDATE** - The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer reported orally, further to Minute 4644 on progress with regard to the Vehicle Workshop facility with Humberside Police at Melton.

**Resolved** – That the report be received.

**4682 COMPLAINT TO EUROPEAN COMMISSION CONCERNING ALLEGED ILLEGAL STATE AID** - The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer reported orally, further to Minute 4646 that the Department for Communities and Local Government had

requested information from what they believed to be the three largest fire trading authorities prior to providing feedback to the European Commission (EC) concerning the complaint regarding alleged illegal state aid.

***Resolved*** – That a progress report be submitted to the next meeting.

*Meeting closed at 11.15 am*

