

HUMBERSIDE FIRE AUTHORITY

18 MARCH 2016

PRESENT:

Representing East Riding of Yorkshire Council:

Councillors Finlay, Green, Hodgson, Jefferson JP, Matthews, Pearson, Sharpe and Turner

Representing Kingston upon Hull City Council:

Councillors Mathieson, Payne and Wilson

Representing North Lincolnshire Council:

Councillors Briggs (Chairperson), Grant and Sherwood

Representing North East Lincolnshire Council:

Councillors Hudson and Jackson

Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive, Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer, Monitoring Officer/Secretary, Director of Organisational Development, Director of Emergency Response (Designate), Head of Human Resources, Committee Manager, Ms J Rae (KPMG) and Mrs B Boyes (MIAA) were also present.

Mr D Chapman, Mr A Smith, Mrs M Thomlinson and Mr C Vertigans (Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee) also attended as observers.

Apologies for absence were submitted from Councillors Allen, Burton, Clarkson, Fudge, Sutton and Waltham.

The meeting was held at the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service Headquarters, Kingston upon Hull. Meeting commenced at 10.30 a.m.

(The Chairperson welcomed Councillor H Hudson who was attending his first meeting and returning Member Councillor B Pearson; the Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee and all other persons who were present.)

5054 COUNCILLOR M CHAPMAN MBE – The Chairperson reported the sad loss of the Vice-Chairperson of the Authority, Councillor M Chapman MBE who had died recently. Members stood in silence as a mark of respect.

5055 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST - There were no declarations.

5056 MINUTES – *Resolved* – That the minutes of the meeting of the Authority held on 15 February 2016 having been printed and circulated amongst the Members, be taken as read and correctly recorded and be signed by the Chairperson.

5057 QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no questions had been received from Members in accordance with Rule 12, Part 4 of the Constitution.

5058 PETITIONS AND DEPUTATIONS - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no petitions had been received and no requests for a deputation had been received under Rule 13, Part 4 of the Constitution.

5059 COMMUNICATIONS - The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that no communications had been received.

5060 MEMBERS' NEWSLETTER – This item was included on the Agenda to allow Members an opportunity to ask questions regarding any items included in the Members' Newsletter that had been emailed recently to all Members of the Authority. There were no questions.

MINUTES OF COMMITTEES

5061 Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee – Mr D Chapman, Chairperson of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee presented the minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 7 March 2016.

Resolved – That the minutes of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee held on 7 March 2016 be received.

5062 THE COMPOSITION OF THE FIRE AUTHORITY 2015/16 – UPDATE – The Monitoring Officer/Secretary submitted a report indicating that the Authority had been informed by North East Lincolnshire Council that they had appointed Councillor Henry Hudson (UKIP) in place of Councillor Shepherd. The Monitoring Officer/Secretary stated that since the report was written the Authority had been informed that East Riding of Yorkshire Council had appointed Councillor Bryan Pearson (Conservative) In place of Councillor M Chapman MBE deceased. The report reminded Members that the composition of the Authority is determined by the Authority having regard to the provisions of the Humberside Fire Service's (Combination Scheme) Order 1995 and that the Authority comprises 22 Members appointed on a proportional basis by the four constituent unitary authorities as follows:

East Riding of Yorkshire Council	8
Hull City Council	6
North East Lincolnshire Council	4
North Lincolnshire Council	<u>4</u>
	22

Resolved - That Members note the revised composition of the Authority for 2015/16 as set out in Appendix 1 to these minutes.

5063 INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN 2016/17 – Mrs Boyes (Internal Audit - MIAA) submitted the proposed internal audit plan for 2016/17. Following the submission of the initial draft plan to the meeting of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee on 1 February 2016 (Minute 5018 refers), further consultation had taken place and the draft plan had been revised. The main changes included coverage of key controls relating to the capital programme under the cyclical combined financial systems heading rather than constituting a separate review and including a review of workforce planning. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5048 refers).

Resolved – That the Internal Audit Plan 2016/17 be approved.

5064 TREASURY MANAGEMENT AND CAPITAL EXPENDITURE PRUDENTIAL INDICATORS, TREASURY MANAGEMENT POLICY STATEMENT 2016/17 AND MINIMUM REVENUE PROVISION (MRP) FOR 2016/17 - The Executive Director Service Support/Section 151 Officer submitted a report setting out the Prudential Indicators for Treasury Management and Capital and the Treasury Management Policy Statement proposed for adoption for the financial year 2016/17. The Authority's Constitution required that the Policy Statement is approved by the full Fire Authority and that responsibility cannot be delegated. The report also outlined the recommended policy to be adopted in respect of creating the Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP) for 2016/17, in line with the statutory requirements set out in The Local Authorities (Capital Finance and Accounting) (England) (Amendment) Regulations 2008. In the light of the Icelandic situation in 2008, CIPFA had amended the CIPFA Treasury Management in the Public Services Code of Practice (the Code), Cross-Sectoral Guidance Notes and Guidance Notes and the template for the

revised Treasury Management Policy Statement. The Fire Authority had formally adopted the revised Code on 15 February 2010. An updated version of the Code was published in November 2011 and the strategy statement had been prepared in accordance with the requirements of the new Code. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5047 refers).

Resolved – That Members approve the Prudential Indicators for Treasury Management and Capital Expenditure at paragraphs 14 and 15, the MRP calculated for 2016/17 at paragraphs 17-21 and Appendices 1, 2 and 3 of the report now submitted as the basis for the Authority's Treasury Management activities in 2016/17.

5065 PAY POLICY STATEMENT 2016-17 - The Head of Human Resources submitting a proposed Pay Policy Statement for Humberside Fire Authority for 2016/17, as required by the Localism Act 2011. The Act introduced senior staff pay transparency into local authorities with a requirement that authorities prepare a Pay Policy Statement for each financial year. A statement for the Authority was first produced for 2012/13 and approved by the Authority on 17 April 2012 (Minute 3839 refers). The Authority agreed at that time that the Pay Policy Statement should be reviewed annually by officers and that any proposed amendments would be brought before the full Authority for consideration. The proposed statement for 2016/17 reflected the current structure of the Corporate Management Team (CMT). The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5045 refers).

A Member referred to paragraph 23 and queried whether the level of pay of the Chief Fire Officer in relation to that of the lowest paid employee was about normal in the Fire Service and asked if details of comparisons with other Services could be circulated to Members. The Head of HR undertook to circulate the information requested. (Attached at Appendix 2 is a summary of the information that has been gathered in response to this question). A Member referred to the level of pay of the lowest paid employee and queried whether it took account of the introduction by the government of a Minimum Living Wage. The Head of HR confirmed that employees were paid in accordance with National Joint Council salary scales and that all posts were job evaluated. The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive stated that the National Living Wage would be applied from 1 April 2016.

Resolved – That the Pay Policy Statement for 2016/17 attached at Appendix 1 to the report now submitted be approved.

5066 EQUALITY AND INCLUSION – UPDATE AND MEMBER NOMINATION – The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive submitted a report informing Members that as part of the Service's commitment to equality and inclusion and to ensure full compliance with equality legislation, specifically the Equality Act 2010, a piece of diagnostic work had been undertaken over the last few months. A task group had been established to progress work in the areas that had been identified. The Equality Act 2010 required all organisations providing jobs or services to eliminate unlawful discrimination on grounds of nine protected characteristics: race, sex, disability, age, religion and belief, pregnancy and maternity, sexual orientation, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership. Discrimination included harassment or victimisation and there were a range of types of discrimination. This was complemented by obligations under the Human Rights Act 1998. Further, as a public body, the Authority had a higher duty under the Equality Act to comply with the Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED). Under that duty public bodies were required to have 'due regard' to equality implications in making decisions about their Service, for instance as recommended by the Equality and Human Rights Commission by ensuring robust equality analysis/equality impact assessments are undertaken. As part of the Service's commitment to equality and inclusion and to ensure full compliance with equality legislation, a piece of diagnostic work had been undertaken over the last few months. The diagnostic work had identified areas for progression and work was already underway via the cross-organisational Equality and Inclusion Group (EIG). The key workstreams had been translated into an initial draft project plan which will be the remit for the EIG. The report set out the current membership of the

EIG group and suggested that in order to ensure that the EIG is fully representative; it would be beneficial to have a Member of the Authority involved in the workstreams. This mirrored the approach that the Service had adopted in relation to the Fire Death and Injury Panel which had worked extremely effectively.

Resolved - That Members note the ongoing work on Equality and Inclusion and that Councillor Hodgson be appointed to the Equality and Inclusion Group (EIG).

5067 SERVICE PERFORMANCE AND RISK REPORT END OF THE 3RD QUARTER 2015/16 – 1 APRIL 2015 – 31 DECEMBER 2015 – The Director of Organisational Development submitted a report providing information relating to the Service’s Performance and Risk Framework as highlighted in the following table:

Strategic Risks	
Reduction in external financial support	No change in risk.
Emergency Services Mobile Communications Programme (ESMCP)	No change in risk.
East Coast and Hertfordshire Control Room Project	No change in risk
Review and Development of Protective Security	No change in risk
Prevention Performance	
Accidental Dwelling Fires	18% below 3 year average.
Other Accidental Fires (exc. Vehicles)	4.5% below 3 year average.
Deliberate Primary Fires	13% above 3 year average.
Deliberate Secondary Fires	2% above 3 year average.
Number of Automatic Fire Alarms	4.6% below 3 year average.
Fatalities	3 fatalities (aspirational target 0)
Injuries	22 injuries (aspirational target 0)
Response Performance	
First engine response	8.24% better than target
Second engine response	10.77% better than target
Strategic Projects	
Project updates	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All on track except for the ARK. • A Post Implementation Review has been carried out on the 2014 OEP outcomes and is due for publication.

Further detailed information was contained within Appendix 1 to the report and also the supporting information published alongside the Agenda papers for this meeting on the Authority’s website. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5049 refers).

Resolved – That Members take assurance as to the Service’s proactive approach to performance and risk management and that Members’ thanks be conveyed to all involved.

5068 HEALTH, SAFETY AND ENVIRONMENTAL QUARTERLY REPORT – 3RD QUARTER 2015/16 – OCTOBER – DECEMBER 2015 - The Director of Organisational Development submitted a report presenting the 3rd Quarter 2015/16 report on Health, Safety and Environment. Pleasingly performance in this area continued to improve with virtually all areas showing improvement against the same period last year. During the period there were 25 incidents recorded that resulted in some form of injury; this was a significant decrease on the same period last year (34 incidents). Of those incidents, the majority (19) were sustained to wholetime operational staff (including control). Training and routine activities were the 2 main contributing areas of activity with 8 incidents each of which only 5 injuries were

recorded at operational incidents (3 at fires and 1 each at Road Traffic Collisions (RTCs) and special services). Exposure to or contact with a harmful substance were the most common cause of injury with 5 relevant incidents reported. During this quarter only a single RIDDOR event was reported, a decrease of 1 from the same period last year. Again the Service had seen a rise in the number of near miss reports; 19 this quarter compared to 15 in the same quarter of 2014/15. This was attributed to staff being encouraged to proactively report all incidents, demonstrating a positive improvement in the prevalent health and safety culture of HFRS. Service sickness was now incorporated into the report now submitted as previously agreed. In terms of average days' sickness absence per person, Control had seen the biggest increase compared to the same quarter of 2014/15. This was largely attributed to the relatively small number of staff working in Control linked to the adverse effect of long-term sickness. The Service also presented at the recent, national, Inside Government conference in London on the subject "Award Winning Health and Safety Management Approach". The presentation was well received and highlighted the Service achievements in this area. A summary of statistical data for the quarter was attached in Appendix 1 to the report and supplementary information was published alongside the Agenda papers for this meeting on the Authority's website. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5050 refers).

Resolved – That Members' appreciation of the positive outcomes contained in the report be recorded.

5069 OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY PROGRAMME CONSULTATION OUTCOMES- The Director of Emergency Response (Designate) presented a joint report by the Deputy Chief Fire Officer/Executive Director Service Delivery and himself indicating that at a meeting of the Authority on 11 December 2015, Members were reminded that a number of operational efficiency options approved by Members on 31 January 2014 had now been fully implemented. In approving implementation of those options Members had considered the predicted impact, in particular on performance against the Authority's Response Standards and as Members were aware Service performance was not adversely affected by implementation. In fact, largely due to continued effective preventative work and the Authority's investment in the mobilising infrastructure, performance had actually improved to a position whereby the Service was performing at a higher level against the Response Standards than it was prior to implementation. Members were also reminded of the financial projections for the Authority and informed that further reductions in spend on operational response would be required. As such, Members were also asked to consider a range of operational efficiency options for formal consultation, some of which had been previously consulted upon, as part of the next stage of the Operational Efficiency Programme. The options which were approved for consultation included some that were previously consulted upon as well as some other options which had not. A formal six-week public consultation was approved on options to make changes at stations in the Immingham, Market Weighton, Brough, Withernsea and Hornsea areas. Members of staff, the public, partners and other stakeholders were invited to take part in the six-week consultation, which commenced on 11 January 2016. The consultation process included briefings to a variety of groups and offered the opportunity to individuals and groups to provide feedback by completing a hard copy or online survey on the Service's website or by attending one of the consultation events which were held in the areas that could be affected by the options tabled.

The report now submitted was concerned only with the outcomes of the consultation. A separate report recommending options for approval and subsequent implementation will be brought to a future meeting of the Authority. A more detailed consultation pack had been made available through the Member Newsletter, which provided further detail of the responses to the consultation. The actual returns including hard copies were available for Members (or any other interested person) to view in the Corporate Communication office at Service Headquarters. An overview of the outcomes from the consultation process was attached at Appendix A to the report.

The objective of the consultation was to encourage communities and key stakeholders to express their views on options that Members had decided to consult on. Participants in the consultation were encouraged to indicate their most and least favoured options from those approved for consultation by the Authority. The consultation provided information on how implementation of the options would impact on performance against the Authorities response standards and also considered risk and cost. All of the information was placed on the homepage of the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service website and advertised through traditional media channels including both print and broadcast in addition to being circulated via social media. Public consultation events were also held in the areas directly affected. To encourage as much participation as possible, members of the public were signposted to the Service website where they could view details of the programme. A total of five public consultation events were held in the station areas directly affected and were attended by approximately 290 members of the public. Invitations were sent to the town and parish councils, businesses, partners and community groups in the areas directly affected. All four Unitary Authorities were contacted in advance of their full Council meetings with the offer of senior managers to attend to present the consultation and the Deputy Chief Fire Officer/Executive Director Service Delivery was invited to meetings within East Riding of Yorkshire Council, North Lincolnshire Council and Hull City Council to discuss the options.

With regard to consultation responses the report indicated that in total, 597 feedback forms were received (421 online forms and 176 paper responses). A preferential voting system was used and the consultation feedback form asked participants to put each option in order of preference 75 respondents chose to abstain from choosing any preferences. There were 64 feedback forms received which were not completed in a way which allowed the data to be accurately extracted. That left a total of 458 responses for analysis which was a significant improvement on the previous Operational Efficiency Programme consultation return of 258. Appendix A to the report set out the overall analysis of the feedback and provided Members with an insight into the views of both staff and external stakeholders, which might assist the Authority in deciding which options should or should not be approved for implementation. Letters were received as formal feedback from the Retained Firefighters Union (RFU), the Fire Brigades Union (FBU), David Davis MP for Howden and Holderness, East Riding Council Safer and Stronger Communities, Market Weighton Town Council, Withernsea Town Council, Sancton Parish Council and South Killingholme Parish Council and some members of the public. Copies of these responses can be found in the Member Newsletter.

The report identified the following general trends from the feedback:

- Overall, the most favoured option was to merge Immingham East and West Fire Station and remove one engine (Option 1). This was further reinforced as it emerged as the most preferred option when participants were asked to choose between this option and removing a fire engine from Immingham West (Option 2).
- Overall, the least preferred option was to remove one fire engine from Market Weighton (Option 3).
- Participants were asked to choose their preferred option between removing a fire engine from Market Weighton (Option 3) and removing a fire engine from Brough (Option 4). The removal of a fire engine from Brough (Option 4) was the most preferred option.

The consultation questionnaire gave respondents the opportunity to comment on the options, the programme as a whole and also to make suggestions for different options. Some themes had emerged from the comments with regard to:

- Concerns over growing population
- Increase in non-fire emergency
- Make savings elsewhere

- Pay more in Council Tax
- Rural roads (RTCs)
- Isolated locations
- Largest savings at Immingham

There were a number of comments received which suggested alternative options to those being consulted upon. In general the themes of those operational suggestions and the reasons why they have not been brought forward were as follows:

Replacing wholetime crew with on-call firefighters - The areas suggested either could not be achieved within Response Standards or were options where in actual fact the pump could have been removed in its entirety if Members had chosen to consult upon them at the meeting in December 2015.

Replacing wholetime engines with Tactical Response Vehicles (TRVs) - The TRVs are a very useful firefighting resource. However the Service does not currently count a TRV attendance within the response standard performance, therefore the suggestions could only be implemented if the detail of the response standard was changed and that was not proposed.

External stakeholders generally favoured options which have the biggest cost savings. All responses were available in the Member newsletter.

A Member referred to the use of the TRVs and queried whether the Authority should be looking at including those vehicles in the Standard Response Times performance. The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive stated that that would be quite a complicated issue and would probably be best discussed initially at a Member Day and then Members could consider whether a paper should be submitted to the Authority on the subject.

The Chairperson on behalf of the Authority expressed Members' thanks to the team of Officers involved in the consultation exercise and also all those who responded to the consultation.

Resolved - (a) That Members consider the outcomes of the consultation at the Member Day to be held on 31 March 2016, and

(b) that Members receive a report with officer recommendations for final decision at the meeting of the Authority to be held on 25 April 2016.

5070 EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS/PUBLIC - Resolved – That the press and public be excluded from the meeting for consideration of the following items (Minute 5071-5075) on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraphs 1, 2, 3 and 4 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

(In making its decision the Authority confirmed that having regard to all the circumstances it was satisfied that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information).

5071 EAST HULL INTEGRATED CARE CENTRE – The Executive Director Service Support/Section151 Officer reminded Members that at the meeting of the Authority on 11 December 2015 Members had approved the proposal to re-locate the existing East Hull station to a new fit-for-purpose facility within the proposed East Hull ICC and had requested that an update on the lease negotiations be submitted to the next meeting of the Authority (Minute 4998 refers). The Executive Director Service Support/Section151 Officer gave a brief oral update and stated that a report would be submitted to the next meeting of the Authority.

Resolved – That the report be noted.

SERVICE REDESIGN PROGRAMME (SRP)

5072 Transactional Administration Review – Outcomes from Consultation – The Head of Human Resources submitted a report reminding Members that the December 2015 meeting the Authority had given approval to undertake consultation on Service Redesign Programme (SRP) proposals to rationalise the administration resource across the organisation by centralising administration provision at Service Headquarters (Minute 4999 refers). The report detailed the outcome of the consultation exercise and presented a proposal for restructuring the transactional administration model.

Resolved - That Members approve the implementation of the Transactional Administration model following the formal consultation process.

5073 Early Voluntary Release - The Head of Human Resources submitted a report reminding Members that the December 2015 meeting the Authority had given approval to the use of Early Voluntary Release (EVR) to facilitate the introduction of the Transactional Administration Review (Minute 5000 refers). The report detailed the outcome from the EVR exercise together with a recommended way forward.

Resolved - That Members approve the use of £630k from the Service's Change Management Reserve or the current year's underspend to fund the supported EVR applications.

5074 EMERGENCY SERVICES MOBILE COMMUNICATIONS PROGRAMME (ESMCP)

– The Director of Emergency Response (Designate) submitted a report providing an update on work that had been ongoing nationally to commission a replacement for the emergency services' radio scheme and highlighting the intention of the Service to transition to the new Emergency Services Network as part of the roll-out programme. The ESMCP, led by the Home Office, had been working for some time to procure an alternative to the existing national communications network provided by Airwave Solutions Ltd ('Airwave') which was currently used by the three emergency services and other public safety users for secure mobilising and incident communications via radio. The new network will be called the Emergency Services Network (ESN). The requirement to procure, install and transition to an alternative national network derives from the overall Airwave contracts coming to an end by 2020. The national fire and rescue service specific contract ("Firelink") would end in 2019. The timeline for national implementation was challenging and that was accepted by all involved but efforts were continuing in alignment with the existing timeline. In scoping the programme, the Home Office had determined that the most appropriate solution would be a move to a 4G LTE commercial mobile communications network for a modern, fit-for-purpose provision. Following a competitive tendering process the contracts were awarded in late-2015 as outlined in the report.

The current timetable showed the emergency services in the Yorkshire and Humber region transitioning onto the new network in 2018, with the delivery of some of the enabling infrastructure starting in 2016. The Fire Resilience Directorate (FRD) Policy Team had provided a pack of information on which to make an informed decision on whether to participate in the ESN. The move of FRD to the Home Office was not expected to have any impact on the information. Prior to FRD releasing the significant levels of funding to Services they required that Chief Fire Officers provide them with the commitment that they will take up the new ESN service. The deadline for this sign-off (or otherwise) was 25 March 2016. FRD was not mandating take-up of ESN. However maintaining the status quo and remaining with Airwave was not an option, consequently, should the Service have decided not to take up ESN, an alternative method of communications would need to have been found; which would have needed to be funded locally and interoperable with other agencies and emergency services. On this basis, the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive had confirmed an intention to participate in the ESN, with the caveat that this position will be reviewed if there is likely to be a significant cost increase. A Yorkshire and Humber regional

group had already been formed and was currently considering appropriate project structures and governance arrangements to ensure all services were adequately supported during transition to the ESN.

Resolved - That Members note the report and the Service's intention to transition to the new Emergency Services Network.

5075 COLLABORATION UPDATE - The Chairperson and Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive gave a brief oral update, further to Minute 5037, on the following matters:

- Government consultation paper on a range of proposals to increase joint working between the emergency services -

The Chairperson stated that Deputy Chief Fire Officer/Executive Director Service Delivery and himself had attended the recent national Fire Conference and reported orally on the statements made by the Fire Minister, Shadow Fire Minister and Baroness Bakewell regarding closer collaboration between emergency services. The Chairperson also stated that the recent announcement by the Chancellor of the Exchequer regarding additional funding for a 'Greater Lincolnshire' lead by an elected Mayor showed that the situation was very fluid and that Members would be kept informed of developments at Member Days or Authority meetings.

- Possible merger between North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Authority and Humberside Fire Authority –

The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive stated that discussions at an Officer level were continuing with a view to bringing an outline business case to the June 2016 meeting of the Authority.

Resolved – That the report be noted.

ANY OTHER BUSINESS

5076 Officer Retirements – The Chairperson reported that K Evans, Director of Public Safety and D Oprey, Director of Emergency Response were attending their last meeting of the Authority prior to their impending retirement on 31 March 2016 and on behalf of Members thanked the Officers for their contributions to the work of the Authority and expressed best wishes for a long and healthy retirement.

Meeting closed at 11.26 am

Appendix 1

COMPOSITION OF FIRE AUTHORITY 2015/2016
(REVISED MARCH 2016)

1. **East Riding of Yorkshire Council (8)**

Councillor Helen Green	(Conservative)
Councillor Arthur Hodgson	(Conservative)
Councillor Christopher Matthews	(Conservative)
Councillor Bryan Pearson	(Conservative)
Councillor Dee Sharpe	(Conservative)
Councillor Peter Turner	(Conservative)
Councillor Barbara Jefferson JP	(Independent)
Councillor Shelagh Finlay	(Labour)

2. **Hull City Council (6)**

Councillor Peter Allen	(Labour)
Councillor Carol Clarkson	(Labour)
Councillor Leanne Fudge	(Labour)
Councillor Steve Wilson	(Labour)
Councillor Karen Mathieson	(Liberal Democrat)
Councillor Ruth Payne LLB (Hons)	(Liberal Democrat)

3. **North East Lincolnshire Council (4)**

Councillor Philip Jackson	(Conservative)
Councillor Mike Burton	(Labour)
Councillor Ray Sutton	(Labour)
Councillor Henry Hudson	(UKIP)

4. **North Lincolnshire Council (4)**

Councillor John Briggs	(Conservative)
Councillor Nigel Sherwood	(Conservative)
Councillor Rob Waltham	(Conservative)
Councillor Mick Grant	(Labour)

Appendix 2

Sample of Combined FRAs – Ratio of highest to lowest paid based on available Pay Policy Statements for 2016/17

Fire Authority	Ratio of highest paid to lowest paid
Lancashire CFA	11.16
Buckinghamshire CFA	10.71
Staffordshire CFA	10.56
Humberside CFA	10.14
Bedfordshire CFA	9.8
Cheshire CFA	9.5
Leicestershire CFA	8.91
Durham CFA	8.9

