

**HUMBERSIDE FIRE AUTHORITY**

**28 SEPTEMBER 2018**

**PRESENT:**

**Representing East Riding of Yorkshire Council:**

Councillors Chadwick, Finlay, Green, Healing, Matthews, Smith, V. Walker and Whittle.

**Representing Kingston upon Hull City Council:**

Councillors Belcher, Chambers, Dad, Nicola, Rodmell and C Randall (Mrs).

**Representing North Lincolnshire Council:**

Councillors Briggs (Chairperson), Grant and Waltham MBE.

**Representing North East Lincolnshire Council:**

Councillors Barfield, Shepherd, Swinburn and T. Walker.

Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive, Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 Officer, Director of Emergency Response, Director of Human Resources, Director of Operational Training, Director of Public Safety, Director of Service Support, Committee Manager and Mr D Chapman (Chairperson of the GAS Committee) were also present.

Mr A Smith, Mrs A Thomlinson and Mr C Vertigans Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee) also attended as observers.

Apologies for absence were submitted from Councillor Sherwood and Mr K Hunter, Police & Crime Commissioner for Humberside.

The meeting was held at the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service Headquarters, Kingston upon Hull. Meeting commenced at 10.30 a.m.

*(The Chairperson welcomed the Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee and all others present.)*

**5942 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST** – There were no declarations.

**5943 MINUTES** – **Resolved** - That the minutes of the meeting of the Authority held on 27 July 2018 having been printed and circulated amongst the Members, be taken as read and correctly recorded and be signed by the Chairperson.

**5944 QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS** - The Committee Manager stated that no questions had been received from Members in accordance with Rule 12, Part 4 of the Constitution.

**5945 PETITIONS AND DEPUTATIONS** - The Committee Manager stated that no petitions had been received and no requests for a deputation had been received under Rule 13, Part 4 of the Constitution.

**COMMUNICATIONS**

**5946 Local Government Association (LGA) Leadership Essentials Fire & Rescue Programme** - The Chairperson reminded Members that details had been circulated to all Members of a LGA Leadership Essentials Fire & Rescue Programme to be held at Coventry on 28/29 November 2018 and invited Members to express an interest in attending.

**Resolved** – That Councillors Green, Smith and Walker will attend.

**5947 Other Communications** – The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive reported orally on the following items:

- UKRO Challenge 2018 – A team from Humberside Fire & Rescue Service were participating in this event which will be held in Cardiff from 27 – 29 September 2018. Members expressed their best wishes to the team.
- Feedback on First Responder Scheme – Positive feedback had been received recently from the Yorkshire Ambulance Service and East Midlands Ambulance Service NHS Trusts following the attendance of HFRS firefighters at incidents under the First Responder scheme which had resulted in a number of patients being resuscitated. Notes of thanks from those assisted had also been received.
- Fire Exercise at Drax Power Station – HFRS, along with North Yorkshire FRS will be participating in a major fire training exercise being held at Drax Power Station this coming weekend.
- Future of East Hull Fire Station – Following the opening of the East Hull Integrated Care Centre the future of the site will be considered at the 26 October 2018 HFA meeting.

**5948 MEMBERS' NEWSLETTER** – This item was included on the Agenda to allow Members an opportunity to ask questions regarding any items included in the Members' Newsletter that had been emailed recently to all Members of the Authority. There were no questions.

**5949 GOVERNANCE, AUDIT AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE REVIEW OF TERM OF OFFICE OF INDEPENDENT CO-OPTED MEMBERS, ALLOWANCES AND TERMS OF REFERENCE** – The Committee Manager presented a report by the Monitoring Officer/ Secretary reviewing the term of office of Independent Co-opted Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny (GAS) Committee; the allowances they receive and also the Terms of Reference of the Committee. In 2017 the Members of the GAS Committee had also been appointed by the Police and Crime Commissioner (PCC) for Humberside to serve on a joint Humberside Police/PCC Audit Committee for periods of 3 and 5 years up to 2022. At that time it was considered that the arrangement might lead to a joint committee with the HFA being established as a further collaboration initiative. In view of this the Authority agreed in June 2017 to extend the period of appointment of all of the Members of the GAS Committee to 31 March 2019 to ensure continuity of the Committee, and also that a review be carried out prior to September 2018 to consider the potential for a joint committee with the Police/PCC. The report now submitted updated Members on subsequent discussions between Officers of the Authority and the PCC's Office regarding the possibility of closer collaboration between the GAS Committee and the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee. Those discussions were extended to include discussions with the Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson of the Fire Authority and the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive, and also with the Independent Co-opted Members of the GAS Committee and the Chief Executive to the PCC. The discussions had led to agreement as to the best way to proceed and the endorsement of the recommendations set out in the report now submitted.

With regard to the terms of office the report indicated that it was necessary to maintain a degree of independence by limiting the maximum period a person might serve on the respective HFA/PCC Committees. There was a consensus that a Member should not serve for more than 2 four year terms; that continuity is beneficial and therefore the term of office of the Members of the GAS Committee should be aligned with the term of office of those Members on the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee as set out in the report, and that going forwards the Authority and the PCC will collaborate by conducting a joint recruitment process for future Committee Members on the basis that any Member appointed shall serve on both the GAS Committee and the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee.

With regard to allowances the report set out the basis on which Members of the GAS Committee and the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee were remunerated at present and indicated that an option would be to pay Members of both committees on the same basis using the Home Office attendance at Appeals Tribunals day rate as set out in the report. Taking on board views expressed by Members of the GAS Committee it was proposed that

Members of the GAS Committee should receive an annual allowance (paid monthly rather than an as attendance allowance) calculated on the same basis as that adopted for the Police/PCC Audit Committee and that the Authority make the necessary amendment when it next reviews its Members' Allowances Scheme for 2019/20.

With regard to the proposed revised Terms of Reference of the GAS Committee the discussions between officers from Fire and Police had concluded that there were no substantive advantages to fully merging the two committees at the moment. The greatest benefits will flow from the sharing of Independent Members as proposed which should help to identify potential areas of closer working and therefore further efficiency and effectiveness. It was recognised that the GAS Committee also performs a scrutiny role on behalf of the Authority but that scrutiny is not a function of the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee which is undertaken by the Police and Crime Panel. To allow the GAS Committee meeting time to further develop its public scrutiny role it was proposed that the Committee's existing Governance role shall revert back to the Monitoring Officer and the HFA. A proposed revised terms of reference was attached at Appendix A to the report. There would also be some consequential amendments to parts of Schedule 2 of Part 2 to the Constitution as set out in Appendix B to the report. With regard to the scrutiny work of the GAS Committee, it was intended that 2 or 3 of the meetings a year will be largely devoted to scrutiny topics and that that will ensure that the scrutiny topics are scrutinised in public with the participation of officers that are appropriate to the subject in attendance. The Head of Corporate Assurance was also looking to source further training for GAS Members on undertaking scrutiny exercises and also arranging attendance at scrutiny panels undertaken by the 4 Unitary Authorities in the Humberside area. Training on undertaking scrutiny work was provided for Members of the GAS Committee by a Scrutiny Officer from East Riding of Yorkshire Council on the rising of its meeting held on 17 September 2018.

**Resolved** – (a) That the term of office of the Independent Members of the GAS Committee should be aligned with the term of office of those Members on the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee as set out below:

2 Members to serve for 2 years (1/4/2019 to 31/3/2021) [Mr Allingham and Mr Vertigans]

3 Members to serve for 3 years (1/4/2019 to 31/3/2022) [Mr Chapman, Mr Smith and Mrs Thomlinson]

2 Members to serve for 4 years (1/4/2019 to 31/3/2023) [Mr Doyle and Mrs Jackson]

Existing Members will be eligible for re-appointment for the above periods. At the end of the above appointment periods the positions will be re-advertised for 4 year terms;

(b) that the appointments shall be appointments to both the GAS Committee and the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee and resignation by an individual Member from either Committee shall result in the termination of the appointment on the other Committee;

(c) that going forwards the Authority and the PCC will collaborate by conducting a joint recruitment process for future Committee Members on the basis that any Member appointed shall serve on both the GAS Committee and the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee;

(d) that recognising that Members of the Joint Police/PCC Audit Committee are paid an attendance allowance based on the rates set by the Home Office for attendance at Appeals Tribunals the Authority agrees that the Independent Co-opted Members of the GAS Committee should be paid on a similar basis, and that in relation to the Members of the GAS Committee that they receive an annual allowance (paid monthly rather than an as attendance allowance) calculated on the same basis as that adopted for the Police/PCC Audit Committee as set out below:

	GAS Committee (Based on 7 meetings)	Police/PCC Committee (Based on 5 meetings)
Chair	£1,680/year (£140 per month)	£1,200/year
6 other Members	£1,480.50 each/year (£123.375 per month)	£1,057.50 each/year
Total cost	£10,563/year	£7,545/year
Current cost	£4,397/year	£7,545/year

Mileage and bridge toll costs will continue to be met as before. The only exceptions to the above remuneration arrangements for Independent Co-opted Members of the GAS Committee will be on the very rare occasions when they might be asked to attend training arranged for them in support of their role e.g. Treasury Management training when such attendance will qualify for the one-off £26 hourly rate + travel expenses + bridge tolls. In addition, for attendance at HFA Member Days/HFA meetings, GAS Committee Members will be reimbursed for their travel expenses and bridge tolls

(e) that with regard to part (d) above the Authority will make the necessary amendment when the Authority next reviews its Members' Allowances Scheme for 2019/20; and

(f) that the Authority approves the proposed revised Terms of Reference for the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee set out in Appendix A to these minutes and the associated consequential amendments to parts of Schedule 2 of Part 2 to the Constitution as set out in Appendix B with immediate effect and that the Authority's Constitution be amended accordingly.

## MINUTES OF COMMITTEES

**5950 Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee** – Mr D Chapman, Chairperson of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee presented the minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 17 September 2018 and in doing drew Members' attention to the following items:

- (i) Review of Anti-Fraud Related Policies (Minute 5930 refers) – Mr Chapman drew Members attention to the omission from the report of a reference to the scrutiny review of Counter Fraud which was reported to the GAS Committee held on 9 April 2018 (Minute 5779 refers).
- (ii) Internal Audit Contract 1 April 2019 Onwards (Minute 5931 refers) – Mr Chapman expressed his appreciation at being invited to serve on the Evaluation Panel.
- (iii) Health, Safety and Environmental Report for the 1st Quarter Period April – June 2018 (Minute 5934 refers) – Mr Chapman stated that the Executive Summary to the report had been very well received by Members of the GAS Committee and had recommended it as a template for future reports to the Committee.

Mr Chapman also informed Members that the Committee had received training on undertaking scrutiny work provided by Officers from East Riding of Yorkshire Council on the rising of the Committee meeting on 17 September 2018 which had been well received by GAS Committee Members and on their behalf expressed thanks to the Monitoring Officer/ Secretary for arranging the training. Mr Chapman also reported that Mr Smith and Mrs Thomlinson had attended as observers a meeting of East Riding of Yorkshire Council's Scrutiny Panel on 21 September 2018 and had found it very informative.

**Resolved** – That the minutes of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee held on 17 September 2018 be received.

**5951 ANNUAL AUDIT LETTER** - Further to Minute 5912 the Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 Officer presented the final Annual Audit Letter in respect to the Authority's accounts for 2017/18 indicating that KPMG had issued an unqualified opinion on the Authority's 2017/18 financial statements; had concluded that the Authority's Annual Governance Statement was consistent with their understanding; and that KPMG had also concluded that the Authority had put in place proper arrangements to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources. The letter also indicated that KPMG's fee for 2017-18 was £31,897 excluding VAT which was in line with the planned fee. The letter had previously been considered by the GAS Committee (Minute 5926 refers). The Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 Officer informed Members that Mr G Barker (Mazars) will be the lead officer for the new external auditors for 2018/19 and that he will be attending the December 2018 meeting of the Authority, having already attended the GAS Committee meeting on 17 September 2018.

**Resolved** – (a) That the Annual Audit Letter be noted, and

(b) that the Finance Team be congratulated on achieving such an audit opinion.

**5952 INTERNAL AUDIT CONTRACT 1 APRIL 2019 ONWARDS** – The Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 Officer presented a joint report by the Monitoring Officer/Secretary and himself recommending the commencement of a tender process to secure Internal Audit Services for a three-year period (with the option of a two-year extension) from 1 April 2019. Members were reminded that the current internal audit service has been delivered by Mersey Internal Audit Agency (MIAA) since 1 April 2014. The appointment of MIAA was approved following a nationally advertised competitive tendering exercise, undertaken in late 2013 and early 2014. MIAA were appointed for an initial three-year period from 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2017. An option to extend for a further two years (to 31 March 2019) was included as part of the tendering process and was implemented following Authority approval in September 2016. With regard to the Tender process the report indicated that internal audit services had previously been procured as a three-year fixed price contract, with an optional two-year extension clause. It was proposed to continue with that approach and commence the tender process in readiness for 1 April 2019. It was recommended that an open competitive tendering process be undertaken, advertised nationally to ensure transparency and value for money, and also proposed that the Evaluation Panel be constituted as follows:

- The Chairperson or Vice Chairperson of the Fire Authority
- The Chairperson of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee
- The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive (or nominee)
- The Executive Director Service Support/S.151 Officer
- The Monitoring Officer/Secretary
- The Head of Corporate Assurance
- The Head of Finance

The report set out a broad timetable for the tender process. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5931 refers).

**Resolved** – That Members approve the process for the procurement of Internal Audit Services for 2018/19 onwards as outlined in the report now submitted.

**5953 FINANCIAL OUTLOOK 2018/19 TO 2022/23 AND EFFICIENCY PLAN 2016-20** - The Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 Officer submitted a report considering the Authority's financial prospects for the years 2018/19 to 2022/23 and an update of the Efficiency Plan for 2016-20. The report also provided an update of the rationale for a Prudent Minimum level of General Reserves (PMGR). The Authority's outturn for 2017/18 had delivered an underspend of £11k and a closing level of total Revenue Reserves of £9.87m.

The report reminded Members that the Authority had set a balanced budget for 2018/19. Austerity remained a feature for the short-to-medium term and the Brexit process underway at the moment had created a further degree of uncertainty over future public spending levels. The current financial projections for 2019/20 to 2022/23 had been updated based on the latest assumptions and information and were shown in Appendix A of the report. The key assumptions applied are shown in the table below:

Assumptions applied to the Medium-Term Financial Plan for 2019/20 to 2022/23

	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23
Pay Awards	2%	2%	2%	2%
External Grant*	(2.1%)	(2.5%)	(2.5%)	(2.5%)
Precept Increase	2.95%	1.9%	1.9%	1.9%
• Rates/Fuel	4%	3%	3%	3%
• Utilities	6%	6%	6%	6%
• Insurance	5%	5%	5%	5%

\* Brackets indicate a minus % change

Furthermore, the Authority’s financial projections had been updated to incorporate all previous decisions relating to efficiencies. The attention of Members was drawn to Appendix A to the report which indicated that over the medium-term the Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) was balanced. This was based on the assumption that the Service Redesign Programme (SRP) will deliver the remaining £300k of efficiencies by 2019/20 from the reviews that had been previously agreed and were now being implemented, e.g. the review of Safety. The report stated that the position of a balanced MTFP will be challenged if the Service faces higher cost increases than those set out in the above Table. Most notable would be pay increases above 2% which are not funded by Government. Each 1% on pay adds £300k to the pay bill and therefore a need to find a further similar level of efficiencies. Members were reminded that as reported to the 27 June 2016 Authority meeting (Minute 5173 refers) the Home Office had written to Fire and Rescue Services (FRSs) setting out the ‘offer’ of a 4-year funding settlement in return for an approved Efficiency Plan from those FRSs that wish to be considered. An Efficiency Plan 2016-2020 was developed by the Service which dovetailed with the underpinning Medium-Term Financial Plan, Strategic Plan and Integrated Risk Management Plan and was subsequently approved by the Home Office. The progress update for the 2016-2020 Efficiency Plan was attached at Appendix B to the report.

With regard to a Prudent Minimum General Reserve (PMGR) the report indicated that Reserves are held by the Authority to meet general financial risks and costs that might materialise (General Reserve) and also to meet specific project costs or financial liabilities (Earmarked Reserves). The projection of the Authority’s General and Earmarked Reserves over the period 2019/20 to 2022/23 was set out in Appendix C to the report. The General Reserve was maintained at a level of circa £5m in line with the PMGR over the whole period as the backdrop to the Authority’s robust financial planning. Appendix D of the report set out the analysis that had been undertaken to underpin the need to maintain a General Reserve of circa £5m. More generally, financial risks at a macroeconomic level were likely to be volatile over the medium-term as the impact of Brexit is felt and due to ongoing austerity as a result of the UK’s public finances. By way of comparison the table below sets out Total Revenue Reserves as a percentage of the Revenue Budget for the four FRSs in Yorkshire and Humberside at 31 March 2018:

<u>FRS</u>	<u>Revenue Reserve as a % of Revenue Budget</u>
Humberside	24%
North Yorkshire	22.6%
South Yorkshire	49.4%
West Yorkshire	44.8%

The comparison shows Humberside FRS’s position to be robust and reasonable and underlines the need to maintain an operating General Reserve of circa £5m which is the projected position for the Service shown in Appendix C to the report through to 2022/23.

A Member welcomed the risk assessment set out in Appendix D to the report and suggested that it would be helpful to receive an update at the half year point. A Member also queried how the Authority tested the market when insuring risks. The Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 explained that the level of cover had been increased over recent years but that the level of cover had to be balanced against the insurance premiums, and stated that he would share the risk assessment with the Brokers used by the Authority and ask them whether there are any areas that could be insured. A Member also queried the implications of pay awards. The Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 reminded Members that every 1% pay increase would result in a £300,000 budget pressure. The Chairperson informed Members that the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive had been pressing at a national level for government funding for pay awards.

**Resolved** – (a) That Members note the financial outlook for the Service through to 2022/23 and approve the prudent minimum level of general reserves (PMGR) set out in the report now submitted, and

(b) that an update of the risk assessment set out in Appendix D to the report be updated at the half year point.

**5954 SERVICE PERFORMANCE AND RISK REPORT - 1ST QUARTER PERIOD APRIL – JUNE 2018** - The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive submitted a report providing information relating to the Service’s Performance and Risk Framework for the 1st quarter period April – June 2018 which was highlighted in the following summary table:

<b>Prevention Performance</b>		
Accidental Dwelling Fires	13% above 3 year average.	
Other Accidental Fires (exc. Vehicles)	73.1% above 3 year average.	
Deliberate Primary Fires	5.6% below 3 year average.	
Deliberate Secondary Fires	2.7% above 3 year average.	
Automatic Fire Alarms	3.3% above 3 year average.	
Fatalities	1 fatality (aspirational target 0)	
Injuries	16 injuries (aspirational target 0)	
<b>Response Performance</b>		
First engine response	7.01% better than target	
Second engine response	12.17% better than target	
<b>Projects Update</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Infrastructure</li> <li>• ICT</li> <li>• Collaboration</li> </ul>	A summary of progress for Strategic Projects is provided at Paragraph 8 within the body of this Report.	
<b>Strategic Risks</b>		<b>Score</b>
Reduction in external financial support	No change in risk	<b>72</b>
East Coast and Hertfordshire Control Room Project (ECHCR).	No change in risk	<b>36</b>
Incident Command System.	No change in risk. System is stable.	<b>40</b>
National and local operational learning from incidents and arising issues is integrated into operational development and learning.	No change in risk	<b>9</b>

<b>Complaints</b>				
<b>Quarter 1 Detail</b>				
Driving related	0 Upheld		1 Not Upheld	
Conduct of employees	0 Upheld		1 Not Upheld	
Performance of employees	0 Upheld		1 Not Upheld	
Damage to property whilst responding to incidents	0 Upheld		0 Not Upheld	
Other	0 Upheld		0 Not Upheld	
<b>Current and Previous Quarter for comparison</b>				
	Current Quarter		Previous Quarter	
Totals	0 Upheld	3 Not Upheld	4 Upheld	2 Not Upheld
<b>Compliments and Messages of Thanks</b>				
22 compliments and messages of thanks were received and posted on our Website:				
<u>Compliments and Messages of Thanks</u>				

Further detailed information was contained within Appendix 1 to the report which identified a number of performance issues of note that had arisen during the reporting period. Details with regard to accidental dwelling fires was set out in Appendix 2 to the report. The report also outlined some notable developments in Strategic Projects. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5933 refers).

**Resolved** – That Members takes assurance as to the Service’s proactive approach to performance and risk management.

**5955 HEALTH, SAFETY AND ENVIRONMENTAL REPORT FOR THE 1ST QUARTER PERIOD APRIL – JUNE 2018** - The Director of Service Support submitted a report providing information with regard to Health, Safety and Environmental outcomes for the 1st quarter period April – June 2018. Details of the Service’s Health, Safety and Environmental outcomes for this quarter was contained in Appendix 1 to the report. During the reporting period there were 23 incidents recorded that resulted in some form of personal injury compared to 29 for the same period last year. This was a significant decrease of almost 21% and even more reassuringly, was the lowest number of reported injuries or ill-health for quarter one in the last five years, and way below the five-year rolling average of 30 for quarter one. Interestingly, there were no ill-health episodes recorded, only physical injuries. Due to the makeup of the workforce, most of the injuries, 78%, were incurred by full-time firefighters. This was representative of the workforce and the more hazardous nature of the activities carried out by operational staff. As can be seen from the five-year rolling average the long-term accident trend continues to fall. Training activities make up the highest number of the total injuries reported which was the same as for quarter one for the previous year. However, the notable difference was that for quarter 1 last year training activity accidents made up 38% of the total (11 out of 29), whereas for quarter 1 this year, the proportion of the total had risen to 57%, (13 out of 23). No other activity areas show an increase in reported injuries. Physical Training and RTC remain the same whereas Routine Activities, Fire and Special Service show a reduction. Pleasingly the Service had also seen a rise in near miss reporting in comparison to last year’s first quarter of over 25%. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5934 refers).

**Resolved** – That Members note the report and take assurance as to the Service’s proactive approach to Health, Safety and Environmental outcomes.

**5956 OPERATIONAL ASSURANCE REPORT FOR THE 1ST QUARTER PERIOD APRIL – JUNE 2018** - The Director of Service Support submitted a report providing information with regard to Operational Assurance outcomes for the 1st quarter period April – June 2018. The report indicated that over the last twelve months there had been work towards highlighting the importance of Operational Assurance. An Operational Assurance Plan had been developed to show how the Service will progress in the future. The majority of exceptional practices, safety critical concerns and areas of concern had been highlighted through



Service Control. The main factor for this was due to current themed fireground review of messages and the self-reflection of Control personnel during incidents. Safety critical events that were highlighted during operational activities came from three areas. Five of those were from Service Control, an example being the inability to contact personnel to gather further information at an incident. Three firefighting areas reported an issue around the mains electric supplies being bypassed during a building fire. Areas of Concern were highlighted in 5 areas; 30 for Service Control, 29 incident management issues, 17 firefighting events, 9 road traffic collisions and 1 for working at height. The main trends centered on communication to Service Control, appropriate PPE and safety jets. On a positive note, exceptional practices had risen dramatically in this quarter compared to figures in last year's quarter. Service Control had had 115 exceptional practices submitted, 29 in incident management, four submissions in firefighting, 17 road traffic collisions events and one for animal rescue. The Operational Assurance Team will continue to undertake further developments in several areas reflecting the Services positive approach as set out in paragraph 7 of the report. Details of the Service's Operational Assurance outcomes for this quarter were contained in Appendix 1 to the report. As this was the first report from Operational Assurance there was no comparative data to form the five-year rolling average. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5935 refers).

**Resolved** – That the Members note the report and takes assurance as to the Service's proactive approach to Operational Assurance outcomes.

**5957 ABSENCE MANAGEMENT REPORT FOR THE 1ST QUARTER PERIOD APRIL – JUNE 2018** - The Director of Human Resources submitted a report with regard to Absence Management outcomes for the 1st quarter period April – June 2018. Appendix 1 to the report showed a detailed comparison of absence in the same quarter last year with this year which showed a significant improvement in the majority of areas with an overall decrease in absence of 20%. High levels of activity and focus had been placed on the management of absence over the last 12 months, with a detailed Absence Management Action Plan being developed and implemented which had led directly to improved performance in all areas. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5936 refers).

**Resolved** – That Members congratulate the Director of Human Resources and her staff on the achievements set out in the content of the report and take assurance as to the Service's proactive approach to Absence Management outcomes.

**5958 EQUALITY AND INCLUSION ANNUAL REPORT 2018** – The Director of Human Resources submitted a report detailing a wide range of activities and outcomes focused on mainstreaming equality and inclusion and achieving HFRS Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED) priorities. Publication of the report fulfils a requirement of the Equality Act 2010: PSED to collect and publish information on progress annually to communities, staff and stakeholders. The report had previously been considered by the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (Minute 5937 refers). The Director of Human Resources referred to paragraph 34 of the report regarding the mental health conferences held in 2017 and 2018 and stated that the intention was to broaden the conference to be held in 2019 to health and wellbeing. The Director of Public Safety drew Members' attention to a Community Handbook that had been produced and circulated to each Watch and Team.

A Member congratulated the Director of Human Resources and her Team on the work undertaken as set out in the report. The Chairperson referred to paragraph 10 of the report with regard to the work undertaken by the Authority with regard to the HeForShe Movement and stated that Members had a role to play in taking this back to the unitary authorities on which they serve.

**Resolved** – That, subject to the wording of paragraph 16 being revised to correct a typographical error, the report be approved.

**5959 POLICE/FIRE COLLABORATION – JOINT VEHICLE FLEET AND OPERATIONAL EQUIPMENT MAINTENANCE SERVICE** - The Director of Service Support submitted a report reminding Members that approval was given in 2014 to progress the provision of a joint vehicle fleet and operational equipment maintenance function in collaboration with Humberside Police (HP) as part of the Service Redesign Programme (SRP). The joint service, in the form of Emergency Services Fleet Management (Humberside) Limited (ESFM), formally commenced operation on the 1 April 2015. The report updated Members with regard to the following matters:

Governance - Members are aware the Authority has a statutory duty to collaborate with other emergency services under Section 1 of the Policing and Crime Act 2017. Additionally, there is a further duty to keep under constant review any further opportunities to collaborate where these can be seen to promote efficiency and/or effectiveness. ESFM is directed by a strategic board with senior representation from both HP and Humberside Fire Authority (HFA). The Authority is represented by the Director of Service Support and the Executive Director of Service Support. The ESFM Board reports directly to the Police/Fire Transformation Board which is made up of the Corporate/Senior Management Teams from both organisations, the Police and Crime Commissioner (PCC) and the Chair of the Authority. This arrangement has also been formalised under a Framework Agreement signed by all parties.

Performance - The overriding aim of the ESFM collaboration is to ensure that the right vehicles and operational equipment are available when needed at the right place, cost effectively and in the required numbers to support the strategic aims of the Authority and consequently the performance measures applied to the services delivered by ESFM are drawn from the Service Agreement between the company and the Authority and focus on maintaining the operational availability and capability of the fleet whilst minimising down-time for scheduled maintenance. Targets for which operational vehicles should be available for immediate deployment have been set for the collaboration to achieve, and these are 95% of all Pumping Appliances, 90% of all Special Appliances and 90% of Officer/Response cars. Since the commencement of the collaborative services on 1 April 2015 all of the targets have been exceeded with vehicle availability across the fleet being maintained at the highest practical level. With regard to the maintenance of operational equipment, the emphasis of the collaboration is on ensuring that scheduled servicing and inspection is completed for all assets against a planned schedule and that this is done in a timely manner. As such, since the commencement of the collaboration in excess of 95% of all servicing and inspection has been completed within 30 days of the planned schedule with regular achievement of 100%. Appendix A to the report set out the detailed performance information for both HFRS and HP. This information is formally considered quarterly at each meeting of the ESFM Board.

Finance - At the end of the first year of operation covering 2015/16, the ESFM collaboration delivered an overall revenue cost saving of £44,000 compared with the previous cost of delivering the services as two separate functions during 2014/15. At the end of 2016/17 this revenue cost saving increased further to £186,000 less than the cost of working independently in 2014/15 and increased again to £202,000 less at the end of 2017/18 as a result of the efficiencies being realised. Realisation of these underspends in each year of operation to date has enabled ESFM to establish its own capital and contingency reserves strengthening its long term viability. With these reserves now established, a 5% reduction in the level of funding required from 1 April 2019 onwards will come into effect resulting in a £60,000 recurrent saving for the Authority.

Staff - ESFM employs 42 staff including two vehicle apprentices and a business administration apprentice. Since the transition to ESFM staff from both Fire and Police have been joined by a number of new employees, including the current apprentices mentioned previously. Staff are deployed in support of both client services and as such there are none dedicated to serving only one. More recently

ESFM commissioned a workforce survey which sought to understand the journey staff had undertaken to this point and explore further opportunities for improvement. The level of staff engagement in the process was very high and has resulted in improvements across a number of areas led by the Directors and management team within the company.

**Resolved** – (a) That Members take assurance that the provision of the services continues to be delivered to the high standard previously experienced, and

(b) that Members note the Service is continuing to comply with the statutory duty to collaborate as defined in Section 1 of the Policing and Crime Act 2017.

**5960 INTRODUCTION OF A SERVICE DELIVERY STRUCTURE CO-TERMINUS WITH LOCAL AUTHORITY AREAS CONSULTATION OUTCOMES** - The Director of Emergency Response submitted a joint report by the Director of Public Safety and himself reminded Members that at the HFA meeting 25 June 2018 Members received a report outlining a proposal to introduce a Service Delivery structure, with a single Group Manager responsible for Public Safety and Emergency Response in each Local Authority area. Members endorsed the approach being taken to consult staff internally, key partners and with members of the public over a 6-week period commencing 6 June 2018 to 18 July 2018. The report now submitted provided a summary of the consultation outcomes. The full, un-edited, consultation comments had been provided in the Member Newsletter. A total of 186 responses were received as detailed in the report. All responses had been carefully considered and discussed at a meeting of the Strategic Leadership Team on 1st August 2018 and a decision was made to move to the proposed Service Delivery structure from 1 October 2018 using a phased approach. The Group Managers responsible for each District were introduced to Members and provided an overview of their area at the Member day on 7 September 2018 and Members will receive updates regarding progress at future Member Days. The Director of Emergency Response stated that Members will be invited to attend the monthly locality meetings from November 2018 onwards.

**Resolved** – (a) That Members acknowledge the on-going activity being undertaken to introduce a co-terminus Public Safety/Emergency Response Service Delivery structure, and

(b) that Members welcome that they will be invited to attend the monthly locality meetings from November 2018 onwards.

**5961 HER MAJESTY’S INSPECTORATE OF CONSTABULARY AND FIRE & RESCUE SERVICES (HMICFRS)** – The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive reported orally that a team from HMICFRS had attended HFRS for this week for the Discovery Week of the inspection process and had spoken to 42 members of staff and also Service partners and had looked at the Service’s procedures. The inspection week was scheduled to commence on 5 November 2018.

The Chairperson, on behalf of Members, expressed thanks to the Head of Corporate Assurance for all the work they had done in the lead-up and during the Discovery Week.

**Resolved** – That the report be received.

**5962 DECLARATION OF INTEREST** – The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive and the Deputy Chief Executive/Section 151 Officer declared an interest in the following item (Minute 5963) and left the meeting for that item.

**5963 TEMPORARY PROMOTIONS INTO CHIEF FIRE OFFICER/CHIEF EXECUTIVE AND DEPUTY CHIEF EXECUTIVE POSITIONS** - The Director of Human Resources submitted a report reminding Members that on 27 July 2018, the Authority agreed that the Chief Fire Officer and Chief Executive, once retired, could return to the role on a temporary basis for an initial 2 year period, to a maximum of 4 years. The CFO/CE decided to retire with effect from 11 September 2018 and planned to return to the post on 15 October 2018.

His pension payment will be abated during his re-employment with the Authority. During that period, and potentially longer should the CFO/CE decide not to return on that date, there will be a requirement for the Service to be led appropriately as the Authority continues to provide a safe and effective service to the public and plan for the inspection by HMICFRS in the Autumn. Under the Constitution, the CFO/CE has the following delegated powers:

Part 3 – Decision Making - Section B – Scheme of Delegation

2. Delegation to Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive

- (z) The Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive has the authority to take any urgent action where he/she considers it necessary and in the interests of HFA, provided he/she consults with the Chairperson of the HFA (or Vice Chairperson in his/her absence) and the Statutory Officers. Any action taken in this way shall be reported to the next HFA.
- (m) (xx) to determine all human resources matters not specifically reserved to HFA or other Officers.

The Chief Fire Officer and Chief Executive has decided that the current Deputy Chief Fire Officer and Executive Director of Service Delivery will be temporarily promoted to the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive post and that the current Executive Director of Service Support/Section 151 Officer will be temporarily promoted to the Deputy Chief Executive post. Both of these promotions will run from 12 September 2018 until 14 October 2018 inclusive, with an option to extend if necessary. Both the DCFO and the Executive Director of Service Delivery will continue with their normal areas of responsibility and will continue with all line management arrangements as is during this period. The Executive Director of Service Delivery will continue to hold the Section 151 role. There is, therefore, no requirement for any further temporary promotions beyond the two described in the report. It was considered that it is in the interests of HFA and the Service that the changes above were enacted on 12 September 2018 to ensure continued leadership and the ability to enact correctly the scheme of delegation laid out in the Constitution and it was within the authority of the CFO to do so. There was not sufficient time to constitute an Appointments Committee for this period.

**Resolved** – That Members endorse the decision to temporarily promote the Deputy Chief Fire Officer and Executive Director of Service Delivery to the Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive post and the Executive Director of Service Support/Section 151 Officer to the Deputy Chief Executive post for the period 12 September 2018 until 14 October 2018 inclusive, with an option to extend if necessary.

**5964 DECLARATION OF INTEREST** – Councillor Waltham MBE declared an interest in Agenda Item No, 22 (Minute 5966 below refers) in his capacity as a Member of the Local Enterprise Partnership and left the meeting for that item.

**5965 EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS/PUBLIC - Resolved** – That the press and public be excluded from the meeting for consideration of the following item (Minute 5966) on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

*(In making its decision the Authority confirmed that having regard to all the circumstances it was satisfied that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information).*

**5966 NATIONAL FLOOD RESILIENCE CENTRE – ARK** - The Director of Service Support submitted a report reminding Members that the Service has been looking to progress the construction of a bespoke flood training centre within the area. Over the last 18 months a partnership with the Energy and Environment Institute at the University of Hull had been progressed with a view to developing a joint facility. The report now submitted updated Members on progress to date. In terms of next steps, the Project Board will continue to work with stakeholders and look to explore all avenues available to secure additional funding as outlined in the report.

**Resolved** – (a) That Members note the contents of the report and continue to support the development of the Ark facility, and

(b) that further details relating to the Ark project be discussed at a Special Member Day on the rising of the next Fire Authority meeting on 26 October 2018.

*Meeting closed at 12.08 p.m.*



**Appendix A**

**Article 6 – Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee**

**6.1 COMPOSITION**

- (a) The membership of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee shall be determined at the Annual General Meeting of the HFA. The size of the Committee shall be decided by the HFA.
- (b) The HFA may if it considers it necessary or desirable appoint such number of Independent Co-opted Members of the Committee as it shall determine who shall be selected for their relevant expertise, particularly in:
  - Audit and financial governance
  - Scrutiny of decision making

The HFA will approve a selection process and criteria.

- (c) The Chairperson of the Committee may be appointed annually at the Annual General Meeting of the HFA or elected at the first meeting of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee following the Annual General Meeting.
- (d) The quorum for meetings of the committee shall be 3.

**6.2 FREQUENCY OF MEETINGS**

The Schedule of meetings shall be decided at the Annual General Meeting of the HFA. In addition, extraordinary meetings may be called at such other times as the Committee or Chairperson of the Committee may determine.

**6.3 STATEMENT OF PURPOSE**

The Committee is a key component of the Authority’s corporate governance. It provides an independent and high level focus on the audit, assurance and reporting arrangements that underpin good governance and financial standards.

The purpose of the Committee is to provide independent advice and recommendations to the HFA on the adequacy of the governance and risk management frameworks, internal controls and financial reporting, annual governance processes and internal and external audit, thereby helping to ensure efficient and effective assurance arrangements are in place.

**6.4 FUNCTIONS**

The Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee shall have the following functions, unless decided otherwise by the HFA:

**6.4.1 Governance and Risk**

- (a) Ensuring effective governance is in place and functioning efficiently and effectively and to make any recommendations for improvement.
- (b) Reviewing the Annual Governance Statements prior to approval.
- (c) Considering the framework of assurance and ensuring that it adequately addresses the risks and priorities of the Authority.

- (d) Monitoring the effective development and operation of risk management, reviewing the risk profile, and monitoring the adequacy of management action in addressing risk-related issues reported to them.
- (e) Considering the arrangements to secure value for money and review assurances and assessments on the effectiveness of these arrangements.
- (f) Reviewing arrangements for the assessment of fraud risks and potential harm from fraud and corruption and monitor the effectiveness of the counter-fraud strategy, actions and resources.

In addition the Committee shall receive reports on the following matters (the Committee shall have no delegated authority but may make observations to the Fire Authority):

#### **6.4.2 Internal Audit**

- (a) Considering
  - (i) the internal audit plan (and any proposed revisions),
  - (ii) regular progress reports, and
  - (iii) the Head of Internal Audit's annual report and opinion and the level of assurance it can give over corporate governance arrangements and the effectiveness of internal controls.
- (b) Considering summaries of internal audit reports and such detailed reports as the committee may request from the HFA, including issues raised or recommendations made by internal audit and the adequacy of management action to address areas identified for improvement.
- (c) Overseeing the appointment and considering the adequacy of the performance of the internal audit service and its independence.
- (d) Considering a report on the effectiveness of internal audit to support the Annual Governance Statement.

#### **6.4.3 External Audit**

- (a) Receiving the external Audit Plan, the external auditor's annual management letter, relevant reports, and the report to those charged with governance and consider the adequacy of the of action being taken by the HFA, to address recommendations for improvement .
- (b) Commenting on the scope and depth of external audit work, its independence and whether it gives satisfactory value for money.
- (c) Advise and recommend on the effectiveness of relationships between external and internal audit and other inspection agencies or relevant bodies.

#### **6.4.4 Financial Reporting**

Reviewing the annual statement of accounts to provide assurance that they comply with relevant requirements before approval by the HFA,

#### **6.4.5 Performance Risk and Programme Management**

The Committee shall consider and make observations to the HFA with regard to:



- (a) The effectiveness of performance management;
- (b) The achievement of Strategic Plan objectives;
- (c) The achievement of the Integrated Risk Management Plan (IRMP) objectives;
- (d) The achievement of agreed performance indicators;
- (e) The effectiveness of corporate risk management processes;
- (f) The effectiveness of programme management processes;
- (g) The performance of the Humberside Fire and Rescue Service generally.

#### **6.4.6 Scrutiny - Generally**

##### Scrutiny Function

- (a) The Committee shall review and scrutinise decisions of the HFA and the implementation of policy at Humberside Fire and Rescue Service;
- (b) The Committee shall be responsible for setting its own work programme which shall be tightly focussed on a small number of major issues;
- (c) In setting its work programme the Committee will consider items for scrutiny put forward by the HFA , the Strategic Leadership Team (SLT) and Members of the Committee;
- (d) The HFA shall refer business to and seek advice from the Committee as it considers appropriate. Such referrals will be accompanied by an indication of its preliminary view of the matter under consideration;
- (e) The Committee shall respond as soon as their work programme permits to requests from the HFA to review a particular issue or issues;
- (f) In exercising its scrutiny role, the Committee will ensure that any observations are non-political and are not designed to displace the functions or responsibility of the HFA;
- (g) The Committee shall make such recommendations as it considers appropriate to the HFA arising out of the scrutiny process.

#### **6.4.7 Other Responsibilities**

- (a) Reviewing and assessing the adequacy of the Terms of Reference annually and seeking the approval of the HFA for any proposed changes.
- (b) Producing an Annual Report that provides details of the Committee's work, evaluates its performance during the preceding year and confirms whether all allocated responsibilities have been carried out.

- (c) Preparation of reports on issues highlighted by the Committee recommending appropriate actions for consideration by the HFA or their statutory officers.
- (d) Performing any other relevant activities requested by the HFA.

#### **6.4.8 Additional Powers**

- (a) The Committee is authorised to investigate any activity within its terms of reference and to seek any information it requires from any employee. All employees are directed to co-operate with any request made by the Committee.
- (b) The Committee is authorised to obtain outside legal or other independent advice and to secure the attendance of non-members with relevant experience and expertise if it considers this necessary, normally in consultation with the Secretary, Chief Fire Officer & Chief Executive and Chairperson of the HFA. However, it may not incur direct expenditure in this respect without the prior approval of the HFA.

#### **6.5 POWER TO ESTABLISH SUB-COMMITTEE OR PANELS**

- (a) The Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee shall have the power to establish a sub-committee of the Members of the Committee and any such sub-committee shall be authorised solely to make recommendations to the Governance, Audit, and Scrutiny Committee.
- (b) The Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee shall be entitled to establish such panels or groups as it considers necessary to assist in the discharge of its functions. No delegated authority shall be granted to such a panel and the composition of a panel shall not be confined to the Members of the Committee and the rules of political proportionality shall not need to apply.

#### **6.6 MINUTES**

- (a) Minutes of the Committee will be circulated to all Members of the HFA and shall be included as an agenda item on the HFA;
- (b) The Chairperson of the Committee or nominated representative will be invited at the discretion of the Chairperson of the HFA to present the minutes at the meeting of the HFA and to respond to any questions that the HFA may have in respect to any matter concerning the Committee.

**EXTRACTS FROM CONSTITUTION****PART 2 (The Constitutional Framework)****SCHEDULE 2****Guidance Notes (Paragraphs 3 and 6)****3. ROLE OF INDEPENDENT CO-OPTED MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNANCE, AUDIT AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE****PURPOSE**

As the Members of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee (whether Independent Co-opted Members or otherwise), to provide assurance to the Authority from an independent perspective in respect to Internal Control and Risk Management; Audit; Performance Risk and Programme Management, and public Scrutiny of HFA decisions and the implementation of policy at Humberside Fire and Rescue Service.

**KEY ROLES**

In accordance with the roles and functions of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee set out in Part 2 Article 6.2 of this Constitution, Members' key roles through the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee will be to:

- (a) Jointly with the other Members of the Committee:
  - (i) drive the scrutiny process through enthusiastic and active involvement and engagement;
  - (ii) consider issues coming before the Committee and, where appropriate (provided this does not delay HFA decision making), refer these issues for further examination by any working parties set up by the Committee;
  - (iii) contribute to the good government of our area by monitoring decision-making, standards of service provision and examining policy issues;
  - (iv) monitor the work of the HFA and Officers in carrying out the HFA policy;
  - (v) hold to account Officers for their actions in carrying out HFA policy and require the Chairperson of the HFA to answer questions on any relevant matter;
  - (vi) investigate the basis on which major decisions are taken and, where they are inconsistent with HFA policy;
  - (vii) monitor the HFA's performance through Internal Audit reports and by scrutinising services which are not meeting their targets or where performance is falling;

- (viii) investigate the quality of services provided, and
  - (ix) commission research.
- (b) Individually or jointly with other designated Members:
- (i) participate constructively in the Committee's activities;
  - (ii) participate in the reviews of HFA's services in respect to value for money, efficiency and effectiveness;
  - (iii) participate constructively on working parties carrying out investigations or reviewing existing HFA policies and making recommendations on the development of new policies; and
  - (iv) assist in writing reports.

**6. SPECIFIC ROLES OF THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE GOVERNANCE, AUDIT AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

The Chairperson of the Governance, Audit and Scrutiny Committee will direct and steer the Committee towards the fulfilment of its specific functions and objectives by:

- (a) ensuring, with relevant employees, the effective programming of projects determined by the Committee for inclusion in its annual workstreams;
- (b) encouraging Members to take the lead in setting its annual workstreams and carrying out investigations by ensuring that the scrutiny skills of new Members are developed and that all Members are engaged in the process;
- (c) ensuring that adequate resources (financial and Officer support) are provided and that any pitfalls are resolved or minimised; and
- (d) develop a constructively critical relationship with Officers.