

**Outcomes from Operational Efficiency Programme Engagement Process**

Staff				
	1st	2nd	3rd	Points scored
Immingham option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham West Fire Station	44	3	7	145
Central East Riding option 2: Remove one on-call fire engine from Brough Fire Station	29	12	5	116
East Coast option 2: Remove on-call fire engine from Bridlington Fire Station	26	13	8	112
Grimsby option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road Fire Station	35	2	2	111
East Coast option 1: Remove on-call fire engine from Withernsea Fire Station	14	16	16	90
Combined option 1: Not crew Cleethorpes on-call and Waltham on-call. Relocate 1 fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road and Peaks Lane to Waltham and Cleethorpes between 18:00hrs-00:00hrs	21	8	10	89
East Coast option 3: Remove on-call fire engine from Hornsea Fire Station	18	10	15	89
Combined option 3: Merge Cromwell Road and Peaks Lane. Remove 1 fulltime fire engine.	19	5	11	78
Central East Riding option 3: Remove on-call fire engine from Market Weighton Fire Station	11	14	14	75
Hull option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from East Hull Fire Station	23	0	5	74
Immingham option 2: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham West Fire Station between 21:00hrs and 07:59hrs	8	20	8	72
Central East Riding option 4: Remove on-call fire engine from Pocklington Fire Station	11	9	12	63
Combined Option 2: Not crew Cleethorpes on-call. Relocate 1 fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road to Cleethorpes between 18:00hrs-00:00hrs	8	15	6	60
Hull option 4: Convert one fulltime fire engine from Calvert Lane Fire Station to on-call	9	12	8	59
Immingham option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham East Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 08:59hrs	5	11	19	56
Hull option 2: Convert one fulltime fire engine at East Hull Fire Station to on-call	11	5	4	47
Grimsby option 2: Convert one fulltime fire engine at Cromwell Road Fire Station to on-call	7	10	4	45
Combined option 4: Ride 4 on all fulltime fire engines in Hull and crew SFU 24/7	9	5	5	42
Hull option 5: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Calvert Lane Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	7	6	8	41
Grimsby option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road Fire Station between 01:00hrs and 09:00hrs	8	3	10	40
Hull option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from East Hull Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	3	12	7	40
Central East Riding option 1: Remove one on-call fire engine from Beverley Fire Station	8	3	6	36
Grimsby option 4: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Peaks Lane Fire Station	5	7	1	30
Grimsby option 5: Convert one fulltime fire engine to on-call at Peaks Lane Fire Station	0	8	6	22
Grimsby option 6: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Peaks Lanes Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	1	3	9	18

External stakeholders				
	1st	2nd	3rd	Points scored
Central East Riding option 2: Remove one on-call fire engine from Brough Fire Station	27	6	1	94
Immingham option 2: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham West Fire Station between 21:00hrs and 07:59hrs	19	16	5	94
Combined option 4: Ride 4 on all fulltime fire engines in Hull and crew SFU 24/7	26	5	5	93
Immingham option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham West Fire Station	21	4	14	85
Immingham option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham East Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 08:59hrs	13	13	14	79
East Coast option 2: Remove on-call fire engine from Bridlington Fire Station	15	9	12	75
Combined option 3: Merge Cromwell Road and Peaks Lane. Remove 1 fulltime fire engine.	15	12	4	73
East Coast option 3: Remove on-call fire engine from Hornsea Fire Station	13	12	6	69
East Coast option 1: Remove on-call fire engine from Withernsea Fire Station	14	7	11	67
Grimsby option 2: Convert one fulltime fire engine at Cromwell Road Fire Station to on-call	15	6	5	62
Grimsby option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road Fire Station between 01:00hrs and 09:00hrs	15	5	3	58
Hull option 2: Convert one fulltime fire engine at East Hull Fire Station to on-call	12	5	9	55
Hull option 4: Convert one fulltime fire engine from Calvert Lane Fire Station to on-call	11	9	3	54
Combined option 1: Not crew Cleethorpes on-call and Waltham on-call. Relocate 1 fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road and Peaks Lane to Waltham and Cleethorpes between 18:00hrs-00:00hrs	5	11	8	45
Central East Riding option 3: Remove on-call fire engine from Market Weighton Fire Station	6	8	10	44
Hull option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from East Hull Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	9	5	6	43
Central East Riding option 4: Remove on-call fire engine from Pocklington Fire Station	3	12	9	42
Hull option 5: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Calvert Lane Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	6	9	6	42
Combined Option 2: Not crew Cleethorpes on-call. Relocate 1 fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road to Cleethorpes between 18:00hrs-00:00hrs	7	3	13	40
Hull option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from East Hull Fire Station	9	3	4	37
Grimsby option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road Fire Station	8	2	4	32
Grimsby option 6: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Peaks Lanes Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	3	7	7	30
Grimsby option 5: Convert one fulltime fire engine to on-call at Peaks Lane Fire Station	3	6	7	28
Central East Riding option 1: Remove one on-call fire engine from Beverley Fire Station	5	0	6	21
Grimsby option 4: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Peaks Lane Fire Station	3	3	2	17

Overall				
	1st	2nd	3rd	Points scored
Immingham option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham West Fire Station	66	7	21	233
Central East Riding option 2: Remove one on-call fire engine from Brough Fire Station	56	18	7	211
East Coast option 2: Remove on-call fire engine from Bridlington Fire Station	42	22	20	190
Immingham option 2: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham West Fire Station between 21:00hrs and 07:59hrs	27	37	13	168
East Coast option 3: Remove on-call fire engine from Hornsea Fire Station	31	23	21	160
East Coast option 1: Remove on-call fire engine from Withernsea Fire Station	28	23	28	158
Combined option 3: Merge Cromwell Road and Peaks Lane. Remove 1 fulltime fire engine.	34	18	15	153
Grimsby option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road Fire Station	44	4	6	146
Combined option 1: Not crew Cleethorpes on-call and Waltham on-call. Relocate 1 fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road and Peaks Lane to Waltham and Cleethorpes between 18:00hrs-00:00hrs	27	19	18	137
Combined option 4: Ride 4 on all fulltime fire engines in Hull and crew SFU 24/7	35	10	11	136
Immingham option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Immingham East Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 08:59hrs	18	24	34	136
Central East Riding option 3: Remove on-call fire engine from Market Weighton Fire Station	17	22	24	119
Hull option 1: Remove one fulltime fire engine from East Hull Fire Station	33	3	9	114
Hull option 4: Convert one fulltime fire engine from Calvert Lane Fire Station to on-call	20	21	11	113
Grimsby option 2: Convert one fulltime fire engine at Cromwell Road Fire Station to on-call	22	17	9	109
Central East Riding option 4: Remove on-call fire engine from Pocklington Fire Station	15	21	21	108
Hull option 2: Convert one fulltime fire engine at East Hull Fire Station to on-call	23	11	13	104
Combined Option 2: Not crew Cleethorpes on-call. Relocate 1 fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road to Cleethorpes between 18:00hrs-00:00hrs	15	18	19	100
Grimsby option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Cromwell Road Fire Station between 01:00hrs and 09:00hrs	23	8	13	98
Hull option 3: Remove one fulltime fire engine from East Hull Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	12	17	14	84
Hull option 5: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Calvert Lane Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	13	15	14	83
Central East Riding option 1: Remove one on-call fire engine from Beverley Fire Station	13	4	12	59
Grimsby option 5: Convert one fulltime fire engine to on-call at Peaks Lane Fire Station	3	14	14	51
Grimsby option 6: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Peaks Lanes Fire Station between 00:00hrs and 12:00hrs	4	10	16	48
Grimsby option 4: Remove one fulltime fire engine from Peaks Lane Fire Station	8	10	3	47

\*Key to the points system: In order to avoid a 'First Past The Post' scenario, votes were allocated points. Options that receive a 'First preferred' vote have been awarded 3 points. Options that receive a 'Second preferred' vote have been awarded 2 points. Options that receive a 'Third preferred' have been awarded 1 point.